
**GENDER-BUDGET ANALYSIS OF
SOCIAL PROTECTION AND ACTIVE EMPLOYMENT POLICIES
IN THE REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA**

Publisher



Ministry of Labour and Social Policy
street "Dame Gruev" No.14 - 1000 Skopje
Tel/fax 02 3129-308
www.mtsp.gov.mk
egrozdanova@mtsp.gov.mk

The Publication is a teamwork by four experts:

The authorship team (according to alphabetical order) consists of:

Prof. Dr. Amalija Jovanovikj

Vesna Jovanova

Neda Maleska – Sačmaroska

Prof. Dr. Slobodanka Markovska

Coordinator of the authorship team: Neda Maleska-Sačmaroska

This publication is done with the support of the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) within the sub-regional programme "Gender responsible budgeting in South Eastern Europe: Improvement of the gender equality and democratic rule through increased transparency and accountability". The programme shall be implemented with financial support of the Austrian Development Cooperation.

The opinions and points of view in this publication are presenting the opinions and the points of view of the authors and the same are not opinions and points of view of UNIFEM, United Nations, Austrian Development Cooperation or other associate organizations



financed by

Austrian
Development Cooperation

The creation and printing of this publication is part of the project, "Gender responsible budgeting" This project has been realized by the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy – Sector for equal opportunities.

The Ministry of Labour and Social Policy - Sector for Equal Opportunities in January 2009 launched the implementation of a one-year programme aimed at promotion and introduction of gender perspective in the social policy and in the budgeting policies and processes. The Programme is supported by the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) within the regional programme for Gender Responsive Budgeting, funded by the Austrian Development Cooperation.

The promotion of gender responsive budgeting as an instrument for the advancement of gender equality is one of the recommendations of the European Commission, issued within the Resolution of the 6th European Ministerial Conference (2006) and specified in the Road Map for Gender Equality in Europe 2006-2010.

What I would like to emphasize is that the issue of gender equality and mainstreaming of gender perspectives is not an issue solely of social justice, it is rather an issue of particular significance in dealing with poverty and unemployment and securing equal opportunities and quality of living for all.

The analysis of policies and budgets from the gender aspect shall provide the policy makers with a new dimension in the planning process, which does not consider gender inequality only as a consequence, but also identifies and addresses the causes and processes that created such a policy. Analyzing policies and budgets from the gender aspect shall provide the policy makers with a new dimension in the planning process, which does not consider gender inequality only as a consequence, but also identifies and addresses the causes and processes that created such a policy.

Such analysis should help us understand that the policies and programmes have effects and implications that vary from one group to another, and that, in order to provide equal opportunities for all beneficiaries, the interventions have to take into account such differences already in the process of policy and budget planning.

The Government of the Republic of Macedonia, through the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, is committed to this concept and shows political will and readiness to promote gender equality and improve the position of women.

Furthermore, the gender analysis of the budgets shall help the Government of the Republic of Macedonia to decide how to direct its political decisions towards the achievement of maximal effects, as well as how to reallocate the resources in order to achieve a higher level of human development and gender equality. By realizing this activity, the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy shall contribute to an even greater accountability for its operation to all citizens. The following took part in the development of the analysis: one international expert, with experience in several EU Member States and in the countries of the region, four national experts and representatives of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy – Sector for Equal Opportunities, Sector for Social Protection, Finance and Budgeting Sector and the Labour Sector.

The specific goals of this programme are aimed at raising the awareness for impact of gender on the policies and the relevant budget allocations, emphasizing the gap between the political and budgetary allocations, requiring the Ministries to commit

themselves to accountability in terms of their provisions for gender equality and to changes of the policies and budgets that would aid the promotion of the status of women and would lead to gender equality.

The objective of the present programme is to initiate the process of incorporation of gender perspectives in the budget policies at national level, leading to proper and gender responsive allocation of resources, and better transparency and accountability of the government's budget in terms of gender equality.

One of the results that we intend to achieve by implementing this programme is to include the aspects of gender responsive budgeting in the Budget Circular drafted by the Ministry of Finance regarding the development of the budget, which is forwarded to all ministries and government institutions.

Following the recommendations of the European Commission, UN and other international organizations, the Republic of Macedonia, by implementing the activities laid down in this programme, shall be the first country in the region to carry out such activities on national level. The countries in the region have taken initiatives for gender budgeting, but those were primarily initiatives on local or regional level.

Finally, please allow me to extend my gratitude to UNIFEM and the Austrian Development Cooperation for their financial and expert assistance in the realization of the activities for promotion of the concept of gender responsive budgeting and in the development of the analysis.

Minister of Labour and Social Policy
Xhelal Bajrami

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS.....	6
SUMMARY	7
INTRODUCTION.....	10
1. MAINSTREAMING OF GENDER EQUALITY	10
1.1 POLICIES AND PRACTICES.....	10
1.2 GENDER BUDGETING.....	12
1.3 WORLDWIDE GENDER RESPONSIVE BUDGETING EXPERI- ENCES	13
2. THE SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC CONTEXT IN THE REPUBLIC OF MACE- DONIA	15
3. METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH.....	18
4. SOCIAL PROTECTION.....	20
4.1. DESCRIPTION OF THE RIGHT TO PERMANENT FINANCIAL AL- LOWANCE	24
4.2. RIGHT TO SOCIAL ASSISTANCE BENEFIT.....	30
5. ACTIVE EMPLOYMENT POLICIES.....	37
5.1 SELF-EMPLOYMENT PROGRAM.....	42
5.2. FORMALIZATION OF EXISTING BUSINESSES.....	52
5.3. PROGRAMME FOR SUBSIDIZED EMPLOYMENT	58
5.4. PROGRAMME FOR PREPARATIONS FOR EMPLOYMENT	66
SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDA- TIONS.....	72
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	75

ABBREVIATIONS

EARM	Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia
AEP	Active Employment Policies
APERM	Agency for Promotion of Entrepreneurship of the Republic of Macedonia
LFS	Labour Force Survey
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
SSO	State Statistical Office
GTZ	Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
EUROSTAT	European Statistical Office - Luxembourg
UN ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
ESF	European Social Fund
EES	European Employment Strategy
EU	European Union
ISA	Institute for Social Activities
IPA	Instrument for Pre-accession Assistance
CARDS	Community Assistance for Reconstruction, Development, and Stabilization
ILO	International Labour Organization
MoES	Ministry of Education and Science
MLSP	Ministry of Labour and Social Policy
NAP	National Action Plan
NEAP	National Employment Action Plan
NGO	Non-governmental organizations
PSB	Project Supervisory Board
NPAA	National Plan for Adoption of the Acquis
NAPGE	National Action Plan for Gender Equality
NES	National Employment Strategy
OPHRD	Operational Programme for Human Resources Development
GBI	Gender Budget Initiatives
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
CR	Central Registry
CSW	Centre for Social Work
CPET	Centre for Professional Education and Training

SUMMARY

The gender budget analysis of active employment policies and social protection, as a part of the first pilot project for gender budgeting, implemented by MLSP on national level, has been launched for the purpose of establishing the degree of inclusion of gender-related aspects in the active employment policies and the social protection, and their impact on the budgets

The decision to analyze a part of the employment policies (self-employment, formalization of existing businesses, employment subsidizing and preparations for employment) and a part of the rights of beneficiaries in the domain of social welfare (permanent financial allowance and social assistance benefit) has been made in accordance with the priorities that include the gender dimension, the assessment of the availability of data, and the compatibility of programmes, time and available resources.

From the methodological point of view, the policies are analyzed at four levels: at the level of drafting and adoption of acts, at the level of implementation processes, at the level of coverage of beneficiaries, and the level of monitoring and evaluation of programmes.

In order to achieve the set tasks and objectives, all policies defined in specific strategic documents, programmes arising from the adopted laws, action plans, operational programmes and budgets that accompany such policies, have been analyzed covering a period of two years in order to determine whether and to which extent are gender issues covered by them. The data analysis was complemented by several interviews with relevant persons from the competent institutions.

The key questions that we wanted answers to were: whether the programmes are equally accessible for men and women, and whether they achieved their intended results; what are the benefits, effects and impacts of programmes for men and women, taking into account other characteristics, such as ethnic background, age, place of residence; how to achieve promotion of policies and programmes in terms of inclusion of the gender perspective, and which instruments may be used to arrive at that point; what is the budget distribution in terms of beneficiaries, men and women.

The data collection was the main difficulty that the experts faced in the course of the analysis. The different methodologies for data collection applied by the key institutions that are responsible for record keeping concerning the beneficiaries of these policies, and the lack of statistical data with gender breakdown, still prove to be big problems, since they preclude the establishing of a practice of impact assessment of policies and programs from the gender point of view. The low number of studies and assessments of the policy implementation effects, which would take into account the gender aspects, posed an additional problem.

The findings of the analysis are accompanied by recommendations how to strengthen the endeavors of the Government of RM for further more successful promotion of gender perspective in policy making or implementation, in order to achieve a substantial equality of men and women.

It is apparent that the Government of the Republic of Macedonia and all relevant

institutions, which are included in the processes of development and implementation of active employment policies and social protection programmes, demonstrate political will, understanding and readiness to include the different groups of social categories and beneficiaries in the labour market in a way that would have impact on the reduction of poverty and unemployment and would provide for a greater social cohesion and better quality of living for all.

MLSP – Sector for Equal Opportunities, within the context of the support to policies that promote gender equality, demonstrated its readiness to carry out a gender budget analysis of its own policies (active employment policies and social welfare) and their respective budgets, as a first step of a systemic approach to issues of equality and equal opportunities for men and women.

Still, based on the gender budget analysis of the active employment policies, we may conclude that there is a significant discrepancy between the ambitious strategic plans and their operational application concerning gender issues; therefore we cannot validate the gender sensitivity of the measures. The gender approach is random and it is not supported by complementary instruments and measures, including those programmes which have women as a specific target group.

In the absence of critical criteria, encouraging measures, and other instruments to support and cover a specific group of beneficiaries (adults, long-term unemployed, women, women from the ethnic communities, youth, etc.), the active employment policies shall not be able to achieve the expected results that are laid down by the strategic documents.

As regards the social welfare, which represents a very important aspect of the social protection system, through which the state provides its care and assistance to the most vulnerable categories of the population, the different priorities and interests of women and men, which have deep implications on the citizens' social status, have not been sufficiently taken into account.

Therefore, the analysis indicates that the overall policy planning and implementation processes, the strategies and analyses, as well as instruments for monitoring and evaluation thereof must not be gender neutral. They should contain gender breakdown of statistical data and data cross-referenced according to various parameters, including gender analytical information that clarify the statistical differences. Divided and cross-referenced in this manner, statistical data should become a routine part of each governmental initiative.

In addition, the competent authorities must develop methodologies that would benefit the objectives and the target groups, and devise ways to introduce mechanisms to facilitate the target groups' access to the measures. From the aspect of introduction of gender issues in the employment policies, they should not be restrictive, but open for all citizens, in particular the inactive ones, by introducing activities for their encouragement and for inclusion, in particular of women, in the labour market. It is of crucial importance that, in the course of the development, implementation and monitoring of the active employment policies, proper account shall be taken of the double discrimination and difficulties that women from the rural areas and women from particular ethnic groups are facing.

Having regard to the fact that active employment policies should to a great extent facilitate a speedier integration into the labour market of the beneficiaries of social assistance benefits, there is a need for a greater cooperation and coordination of

all competent institutions that are involved in the process, so as to provide for a balanced access to working engagements for both women and men. The stakeholders of the development, implementation and evaluation of the effects of social welfare policies, and in particular the CSW employees, who are working directly with the potential and actual beneficiaries of permanent financial allowances, should be particularly sensitized about the gender issues within each of the six different categories of beneficiaries. That would require training for the staff on the specific gender needs, in order to provide for an equal access to services and respect of the integrity of all beneficiaries.

There is an evident need of further researches to monitor the sustainability of the formalized businesses, and special studies of the causes that enable, i.e., impede the sustainability of the business for a longer period of time, or for finding a lasting solution for the unemployment. The studies should incorporate assessments of the impact of the policies, strategies and programmes on men and women, ethnic and social groups, the youth and other categories of beneficiaries with a breakdown by gender, as well as further research of the effects of policy implementation in the social welfare domain.

Finally, gender budgeting should become an essential part of planning, implementation and monitoring of policies and strategies of the state, with a sound analysis of the financial distribution of the resources, in a way that would enable the more equitable and balanced allocation of budget resources matching the needs of the various categories of beneficiaries.

INTRODUCTION

The gender budget analysis of the active employment policies and social protection is a part of the first gender budgeting pilot project on national level, launched by the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy as a result of the endeavors of the Government of RM to improve the effectiveness of the policies and activities promoting gender equality. The tasks in question arise from the Constitution of RM, the Law on Equal Opportunities for Men and Women, and the National Action Plan for Gender Equality 2007-2012 (NAPGE), which are in compliance with the international principles and commitments for respect of the human rights, and have been embodied in several binding documents. Equality between men and women is a part of the body of human rights and refers to the equal treatment of men and women in terms of their rights laid down by laws and policies, as well as in terms of providing for equal access to opportunities and benefits in the society.

By this pilot project, the Republic of Macedonia joins the ranks of more than 60 countries in the world that have initiated the process of gender budgeting on the road to providing equal opportunities for their citizens of both sexes. It is worth noting that we are sharing the history with most of the countries in the world where the first steps of the gender budgeting initiatives have been taken by non-governmental organizations.

Our analysis, which covers active employment policies and part of the categories of social welfare beneficiaries, is only one of the steps aimed at supporting the long-term process of gender budgeting that requires the efforts of a large number of stakeholders from both the governmental and non-governmental sector.

1. MAINSTREAMING OF GENDER EQUALITY

1.1 POLICIES AND PRACTICES

Gender budgeting, as a relatively new tool, is a part of the *strategy to ensure that gender perspectives and attention to the goal of gender equality are central to all policies and practices (gender mainstreaming)*.

This strategic approach to promotion of gender equality has been mentioned for the first time at the UN's Third World Conference on Women (held in Nairobi 1985). One year later, the United Nations adopted a Resolution for the work of the UN Commission on the Status of Women, which, in 1987, called upon all bodies within the United Nations' system to develop and implement a comprehensive policy for empowerment of women and to include such policy in their mid-term planning documents. However, in practice this strategy gained broader significance and became globally accepted after the UN's Fourth World Conference on Women (Beijing, 1995). The Platform for Action calls upon the Governments and other actors to "active and visible policy of mainstreaming a gender perspective into all policies and programmes, so that, before decisions are

taken, an analysis is made of the effects on women and men, respectively.”

Grasping the essence of this strategy requires a brief clarification of the gender category, which, as an analytical means of the social sciences, covers the social relations between men and women.

Gender refers to the different identities, roles, responsibilities associated with men and women and the relations between them that are socially constructed and considered to be adequate for men and women by the relevant society. As opposed to biological differences, the gender differences are time-specific and changeable and vary from one society to the other.

These relations determine to a great extent the different needs, interests and priorities of men and women in the economic, political and social spheres in a given society.

Therefore, this model takes into consideration the fact that specific needs and priorities of men and women are different and has to be treated differently so that they can equally benefit from them.

Out of these reasons, the conviction that special programmes and schemes for women are sufficient to overcome the inequalities in the society is increasingly abandoned and replaced by the gender mainstreaming strategy.

Within this context, in 1997, the United Nations Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) defined bringing gender perspective in the mainstream of society (gender mainstreaming) as a “process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in any area and at all levels”.

Still, the most used and the widest accepted is the definition of the Council of Europe (1998), which states: “Gender mainstreaming is the (re)organisation, improvement, development and evaluation of policy processes, so that a gender equality perspective is incorporated in all policies at all levels and at all stages, by the actors normally involved in policy-making.”

As opposed to other definitions of gender mainstreaming, this one emphasizes gender equality as the goal, and gender mainstreaming as the strategy to reach that goal.

In fact, gender mainstreaming seeks to make the needs and experiences of men and women an integral part of the making, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of all policies and programmes in all walks of life, so as to provide equal benefits for men and women. Therefore, this strategy is aimed at achieving social justice and democracy and equitable and sustainable development.

This is also the objective of the National Action Plan for Gender Equality, a strategic document of the Government of the Republic of Macedonia, which seeks to promote and provide for gender equality and make it central to the policies, programmes and projects in different areas of societal action at national and local level. It defines ten strategic and priority areas, among which women and social protection, through poverty reduction measures and development of an adequate social protection system (strategic area 4) and women and employment, through supporting and implementing programmes for economic empowerment of women (strategic area 6)¹.

1 National Action Plan for Gender Equality, 2007-2012, Skopje, May 2007.

Key significance is also attributed to the Law on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men, the goal of which is to promote the principle of establishing equal opportunities for women and men in the political, economic, social and educational areas, as well as other areas of the society. This Law provides the basis for the establishing of basic, special and encouraging measures to boost and promote the principle of equal opportunities².

1.2 GENDER BUDGETING

The Budget is the most important instrument at disposal of the Government, and in this sense it's the most powerful tool used in the transformation of the society that has to address the needs of different groups of beneficiaries.

It should be underlined that the public budgets are not the sole economic instrument, but that they rather summarize the government policies in monetary terms and express the priorities of the governments. Due to the above, the budgets are not gender-neutral. The budgets affect men and women in different ways, reflect the irregular distribution of power in the society, the social and economic disparities and the different social roles.

One should not neglect the fact that budgeting policies could have significantly different impact on men and women, and on various groups of men and women. Sometimes such differences are warranted by the justification that certain policies and objectives have to be reached, notwithstanding their social and economic impact on these groups.

Still, ignoring the fact that policies affect men and women in the society in different ways borders more with "gender blindness" rather than "neutrality" in view of these issues.

Good practices imply an understanding for the effect of policies and the ways how to better formulate them in order to achieve results and meet the needs of men and women, boys and girls, as well as of various groups of men, women and children.

So far, the theoreticians and practitioners drew a distinction between two strategies in gender budgeting – the traditional and the modern approach through mainstreaming of gender perspectives in the budgeting processes.

The conventional concept of gender budgeting implies interventions in the state's policies by virtue of allocation of funds for special programmes concerning the promotion of the status of women, trainings intended for women, or potentially through providing support to specific organizations or institutions (for instance, a Ministry of Gender Equality).

The critics of the traditional approach point out that such measures are not efficient enough, or simply that they are not sufficient to promote the status of women in the society. They say that in addition to ministries, all other public administration bodies and agencies should incorporate in their scopes of competence the gender concepts and the gender budgeting, as a tool for policy formulation and monitoring of the policies' effects.

Namely, the theoreticians and practitioners who deal with these matters raised

2 Law on Equal Opportunities for Men and Women, Official Gazette of RM no. 66/06.

the issue of expenditure of public funds. Notwithstanding whether it is the case of agriculture, healthcare, education or social policy, in essence all of them ignore the issue of the effects that such policies have on men and women under the veil of “*egalite*” or equal distribution for all.

Yet, it is undeniable that government’s programmes in different sectors have different positive or negative effects on women and men, on their economic standing or standard of living.

The new approach to gender budgeting is grounded in the platform for mainstreaming of gender perspective and is accepted by the UN, as an integral part of the agenda of UNIFEM.

The Council of Europe defines gender budgeting as “an application of gender mainstreaming in the budgetary process. It means a gender-based assessment of budgets, incorporating a gender perspective at all levels of the budgetary process and restructuring revenues and expenditures in order to promote gender equality. “

Facing the challenges of the accession process and the harmonization of the national legislation with the EU *acquis*, the Republic of Macedonia has an obligation to take into account also the recommendations on gender equality and gender budgeting that are specified in the European Union Resolution on Gender Budgeting 2003³.

Within its framework, NAPGE clearly elaborate the essence and the goals of gender budgeting and undertaken commitment to incorporate them into all policies and practices. Taking into account the fact that budgeting is not only a financial tool for balancing between the revenue and the expenditure sides, but rather it is a process which represents a method for setting priorities and decision-making for issues which influence the actual and future situation of people and their environment, gender budgeting has been defined as is *a process through which public budgets are examined for the purpose of their assessment whether and how much they include and/or contribute to equality between men and women, and thereby propose changes towards reaching gender equality.*

In addition to political will, one of the main prerequisites for carrying out of gender budgeting is the existence of gender-disaggregated statistical data and indicators. By virtue of such data and indicators, the Governments can improve the processes of programming and planning of expenditures and revenues. This will help them, after the implementation of the budget, measure the effects that these policies have had on the different beneficiaries.

1.3 WORLDWIDE GENDER RESPONSIVE BUDGETING EXPERIENCES

Gender budgeting is an important and relatively new anti-discriminating tool for reaching gender equality, which is used by more than 60 countries in the world and is initiated and implemented in many different ways.

The history of gender sensitive budgeting started with the Women’s Budget Statement in Australia in 1984. The Australian budget statement elaborated the indicators of gender equality, so that this trailblazing initiative inspired many other initiatives.

3 Resolution on Gender Budgeting, P5_TA (2003) 0323.

Since then the practice of gender budgeting has been accompanied by a series of theoretical studies that offer definitions of this tool, analyses of the existing practices and guidelines for development of more adequate methodologies for promotion of the gender budgeting process.

By 2007, worldwide there were many established gender budgeting initiatives, primarily in the developing countries. We can set apart South Africa's Gender Budget Initiative (GBI), launched by the Parliamentary Financial Committee and several non-governmental organizations in 1994 . Following the analysis of all 27 sectors of the national budget and the analysis of the 840 local budgets in South Africa, the economic and social priorities were changed and budget funds were reallocated to the benefit of women. South Africa's experience pointed out to a dramatic gap in the field of gender equality.

As a result of the activities of women's organizations, Latin America and the Caribbean witnessed a series of initiatives for gender responsive budgets in the last decade of the 20th century. The focus of these GBI was placed on poverty reduction, strengthening of public participation in the creation of the budgets and its linking to the environmental issues. The Mexican GBI, which represented a wide civil society coalition, reached the Parliament.

On the Asian continent, the gender budgeting initiatives are the most developed in India, Bangladesh and in the Philippines and are mostly related to poverty reduction.

Nearly a half of these initiatives have been launched in the countries of the Commonwealth. One of the most active support and assistance efforts in establishing gender budgeting projects through the Commonwealth's Secretariat comes originated in these countries. The Commonwealth's Secretariat has initiated the project "Initiatives for Gender Sensitive Budgets" and implements it in conjunction with UNIFEM, the Canadian Research Institute, the Ford Foundation, UNDP, and GTZ.

The issue of gender sensitive budgeting was mentioned for the first time in the European Commission in October 2001, when the Belgian Presidency organized a conference under the title "Gender Responsive Budgeting: Global Vision for Strengthening Economic Governance", in cooperation with the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, UNIFEM, and the Nordic Council of Ministers, thus opening the discussion on the topic of the gender perspective of public budgets. It marked the beginning of the adoption of the gender budgeting strategy. In the spring of 2003, the Consultative Committee for Gender Equality received the draft of document, which the European Commission used as a basis for the recommendations to the Member States and the candidate countries. Furthermore, the Council of Europe adopted the definition of gender sensitive budgeting according to which it is an application of gender mainstreaming in the budgetary process.

Even before the adoption of these recommendations, most of the EU Member States introduced gender budgeting elements in various forms: In Great Britain, 1989, the gender analysis, which focused its attention to the revenue side of the budget and to the taxation policy, inspired the changes in the traditional view of budgets as gender-neutral. In 1996 Switzerland published a pilot study on gender budgeting, which did not focus on the budget as a whole, but rather on the impact of policy changes on men and women, and initiated a series of activities for public awareness raising; The GBI in France in 2000 resulted in the introduction of an obligation for the Government to draft a report on results in terms of gender equality within the draft of the budget; Gender budgeting in Austria has its grounds in article 13 of the Constitution, which provides that

budgeting at all levels of government should aim at reaching gender equality. Finally, we should also mention the experience of the Nordic countries. In particular, the Ministry of Gender Equality of the Nordic Council in 2000 adopted a programme for promotion of gender equality for the period 2001-2005, where the gender perspective is integrated in the national budgets, and the budget of the Nordic Council was included in a pilot project.

Following the experience with such initiatives that improved the gender balance in the political institutions, international organizations such as the World Bank and the United Nations started to institutionalize gender budgeting.

In EU Member States, the integration of the gender perspective in the mainstream policies and public, economic and social programmes gathers momentum and receives increased support. At the same time, there is an increased awareness that the effects of this process would be restricted if it fails to include budgets – starting from the budget of the European Union and the budgets of the Member States, through regional and municipal budgets, to budgets of public institutions.

The review of the world experience indicates that the greatest number of Gender Budgeting Initiatives have, in fact, made the first step at the analytical level, while the key goal of GBI is to integrate the gender concept in the criteria underlying budget planning, formulation and implementation. It necessitates taking the next step which shall enable the transition from gender budget analysis to gender sensitive budgeting.

2. THE SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC CONTEXT IN THE REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA

The process of transition in the countries from the region led to major changes in the social and economic spheres, which resulted in great stratification of the social structure of the population, increased poverty, high unemployment rate, and increased number of different categories of socially excluded people.

The decreased national income caused reduction of social rights and aggravated the social status of a great portion of the population. Due to the decline in the number of the employed, who pay social security contributions, the social funds are growing poor, and the states are forced to allocate funds gathered by collection of taxes and other duties to deal with social issues. This leads to fiscalization of social contributions, which undermines the social security model that is grounded in the contributions and in independent social funds⁴.

Such circumstances did not leave the Republic of Macedonia behind.

The data indicate that the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita is only one fourth of the EU-27 average.⁵

The reasons for this state can be found in the most fervent problem that the country is facing, the unemployment rate, which is exceptionally high (35%) taking into

⁴ Puljiz, V., "The social policy in the post-Yugoslav countries – heritage, continuity, and changes (historical context and social policy)" in *Framing a New Social Policy: Actors, Dimensions, and Reforms*, University Ss. Cyril and Methodius, Faculty of Philosophy, Institute for Social Work and Social Policy, Office of the Friedrich Ebert Foundation, Skopje, 2007.

⁵ *People-oriented analyses*, UNDP, 2008.

consideration the European parameters, and which is one of the primary factors of poverty and social exclusion.

Considering the fact that the labour market does not encompass the human capital in full, but only the economically active citizens (employed and job seekers), this rate in RM was 62.8 % in 2007, and marked a mild increase to 63.5% in 2008. On the other hand, the employment rate is exceptionally low and amounted to 40.7% in 2007, and 41.9% in 2008.

These trends caused an increase in the numbers of vulnerable persons who cannot earn for meager existence. It reflected on the social protection system by an increased number of social welfare beneficiaries. To illustrate, in 1998 there were 49,955 beneficiaries, in 2007 there were 64,143 beneficiaries of the social assistance benefit, and in 2008 this figure fell to 57,687 beneficiaries of the social assistance benefit (see table no. 6, social assistance benefit: no. of beneficiaries).

Men and women face these problems equally, but upon a detailed analysis the disparities become more apparent.

The transition had not only radically altered the social status of the entire population, but it also affected the widening of the gap between men and women, both in terms of social status and opportunities and access to available resources in the society.

These differences may be perceived in several social-economic parameters.

In particular, the unemployment rates for men and women in 2007 and 2008 were roughly identical and amounted to 35.8% and 34.3% for women, and 34.8% and 33.7% for men. respectively.

However, if we are carry out a gender-disaggregated analysis unemployment and activity rates of the population, the differences will become evident. In 2008 men participated with 50.7% in the total employed population, contrasted with women who participated with 32.9%. The difference in the activity rates of the population is even greater, i.e., it amounts to 50.2% for women, as opposed to 76.6% of the men who were active in the labour market in 2008. The greater participation of women in the inactive population is mostly owing to traditional values and norms of the society, women's role in the household and in providing care for the children, in particular in the rural and suburban areas, and within specific ethnic communities - primarily the Albanian and the Roma community.⁶

The specific inequalities are also reflected when measuring the women's labour, in particular in the domain of unpaid labour, which often is a part of the gray economy. Women are mainly assisting members of the family, they do not hold any property or carry out any activity, most often they are labour inactive and represent only a potential, but not utilized labour force in the society due to the traditional behaviour and understanding for the role of the woman in the family and in the society, which is amazingly enough still widespread even in this century. For illustration purposes only, in terms of employment according to the economic status, in 2006 the share of women as employers was 21%, only 17% of the women were self-employed, while 60% of them were unpaid family workers.⁷

In general, women are less represented due to their lower participation in the

6 *Macedonia in Numbers*, State Statistical Office.

7 *Women and Men in the Republic of Macedonia*, State Statistical Office, 2008.

active population, since the female labour force in absolute terms is of a lower volume due to the low activity rate of the female population, in particular those coming from the ethnic communities. Their share in the gray economy is also evident, in particular with the Roma ethnic community, as household assistants (cleaning, taking care of the children, etc.), care for children, the elderly and the diseased, as well as providing assistance in agriculture and craftsmanship.

Women are mainly employed as unpaid family workers (agriculture, craftsmanship, trade), so that their actual activity is legally and formally invisible⁸. Since they are inactive, they do not take part in the labour market. Thus, the rate of economic utilization of the female able-bodied contingent is low, which is also indicated by the low activity rate of the female population.

As noted above, the rate of inactivity of women is nearly twice the one of men.

Within the female population, every third woman aged 25-49 is inactive, in contrast with the male population of the same age group, where every tenth man is inactive.⁹

The empirical literature in the fields of family sociology and social demographics finds that gender specifics come into play particularly in the case of married women. When women create a family, they are facing a double burden and incongruity between their family and societal roles, and one of the consequences of this is the decrease of the fertility rate (number of children per family). This is an explicit indicator of the strong correlation between the economic and biological production that need to be taken into account in the formulation of strategies and action plans regarding the demographic and economic development. It is equally significant for both rural areas (emigration of the young population) and for urban areas.

In the field of social protection, in particular its social welfare part, available data indicate that men are primarily the carriers of social welfare. The percentage of men who were beneficiaries of this right in 2006 amounted to 81%. (see table no. 7 social assistance benefit: no. of beneficiaries per gender)

A great number of studies on social poverty, including those made by the World Bank, which cover the complex relations among social exclusion, vulnerability of specific groups, the access to resources (education, healthcare, social protection, finances) and the power to manage them, point out to the fact that gender inequalities are most prominent among the poor, and that such inequalities in fact decrease the ability of men and women to overcome poverty. Gender inequality, also, is listed as one of the reasons for the rise of poverty.

The National Employment Strategy – 2010 specifies that the policy in the field of social protection should be aimed toward poverty reduction, social cohesion, and social inclusion. Furthermore, it indicates the increase of employment as the primary instrument to combat poverty. In this sense, the Government of the Republic of Macedonia demonstrated its will and political commitment to promote European standards and values in the active employment policies through its intention to increase the employment rate of women.

Thus, in its primary strategic documents, the National Employment Strategy (NES) 2010, the National Employment Action Plan (NEAP) 2006-2008, and in the National Employment Action Plan (NEAP) 2009-2010, one of the defined objectives is to

8 Amalija Jovanovikj, *Fertility and Family Planning in RM*, Metamorphosis, Skopje, 1998.

9 Jovanovikj, A., *Fertility and Family Planning in RM*, Metamorphosis, Skopje, 1998.

increase employment rate of women in the Republic of Macedonia from 30.1% in 2005 to 38% in 2010, with particular emphasis on the inactivity of women from the Albanian, Roma, and Turkish ethnic communities.

Furthermore, we should point out the state's systemic endeavours to promote gender equality and the status of women through a rounded legal framework and an established gender machinery. Undertaking activities aimed at providing a gender analysis of its own programmes and budgets, the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy has once again demonstrated its commitment to give its best endeavors in the field of incorporation of gender perspective in all spheres of the society.

3. METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

The present analysis, as a part of the first pilot project for gender sensitive budgeting in RM, implemented at national level, has been launched for the purpose of establishing the degree of inclusion of gender-related aspects in the active employment and social protection policies, and their impact on the budgets.

The scope of the analysis includes active employment policies and social protection, as defined by the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy.

The final decision to analyze part of the employment policies (self-employment, formalization of existing businesses, employment subsidizing and preparations for employment) and a part of the rights of beneficiaries in the domain of social welfare (permanent financial allowance and social assistance benefit) has been made in accordance with the priorities that include the gender dimension, the assessment of the availability of data, and the compatibility of programmes, time and available resources.

The implementation of these policies falls within the scope of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, centres for social work, Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (EARM) and the Agency for Promotion of Entrepreneurship of the Republic of Macedonia (APERM). The international organizations also take part in the implementation of the programmes by providing different types of support, such as financial, organizational and consultancy support, as well as support in the launching of researches, analyses and assessments regarding the policy implementation.

From the methodological point of view, the policies are analyzed at four levels:

- 1) level of drafting and adoption of acts,
- 2) level of implementation processes,
- 3) level of coverage of beneficiaries,
- 4) and at the level of monitoring and evaluation of programmes.

In order to achieve the set tasks and objectives, all policies defined in specific strategic documents, programmes arising from the adopted laws, action plans, operational programmes and budgets that accompany such policies, have been analyzed covering a period of two years in order to determine whether and to which extent are gender issues covered by them. The data analysis was complemented by several interviews with relevant persons from the competent institutions (MLSP, UNDP, EARM, Institute for

Social Activities (ISA)).

Knowing the experiences and positions of the end beneficiaries would have contributed significantly to a better assessment of the state of play regarding gender aspects in the implementation of policies and programmes, but such researches (focus groups, surveys, etc.) were not provided for within the framework of the project.

The key questions that we wanted to answer were: (1) whether the programmes are equally accessible for men and women? (2) whether the programmes achieve their intended results? (3) what are the benefits, effects and impacts of programmes for men and women? (4) how to achieve promotion of policies and programmes in terms of incorporation of the gender perspective, and which instruments may be used to achieve it, (5) what is the budget distribution in terms of beneficiaries, men and women?

The starting point of the analysis was the methodological procedure, developed by Elizabeth Klutzer, an expert from Austria, who was hired in the capacity of a consultant within the gender budgeting project. The approach used by the consultant provides a review of successful methodological experiences, with special consideration that the recommendations are applicable in our societal context.

It should be noted that the team that carried out the analysis has complied with the methodological guidelines to the greatest extent possible, but failed to apply all of the recommended steps of the proposed methodological procedure, so that several modifications were made.

The greatest challenge that the experts faced in the course of the analysis, and one of the main reasons for the subsequent modification of the methodology, was the data collection. The different methodologies for data collection applied by the key institutions that are responsible for record keeping concerning the beneficiaries of these policies, and the lack of gender-disaggregated statistical records, still prove to be a big issue, since they hinder the establishing of a practice of impact assessment of policies and programs from the gender perspective.

Another reason that precluded the application of these methodological steps was the low number of researches and assessments of the effects of policy implementation that would take into account gender aspects.

The analysis was carried out by a team composed of four independent experts, civil servants from the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy (Sector for Equal Opportunities, Finance and Budgeting Sector, and the Sector for Social Protection) and from the Ministry of Finance.

We hope that the analysis of part of the policies of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, which are of key significance, shall raise the issues, further the discussion and contribute to tracing of the routes for the introduction of gender budgeting.

4. SOCIAL PROTECTION

The Social Protection System in the Republic of Macedonia

Social protection in the Republic of Macedonia is based on the fundamental values of humanism, social justice and solidarity, laid down by the Constitution of RM. According to Article 4 of the Law on Social Protection,¹⁰ social protection is defined as “an organized activity undertaken by the state aimed at the prevention and overcoming of the basic social risks to which the citizens, the families and other groups are exposed”.¹¹ The state’s care for prevention of occurrences of social risks is realized through the undertaking of measures in the taxation, employment, scholarship, housing, family, health and education policies, and other areas in accordance with the law.¹²

The realization of social protection in the Republic of Macedonia, in addition to the Law on Social Protection, is also based on: the Law on the Family; Law on Employment of Persons with Disabilities; the criminal code and other laws and by-laws that govern the social protection rights and services.

The organization and implementation of social protection in the Republic of Macedonia falls within the scope of competence of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy (MLSP), through its Sector for Social Protection, centres for social work (CSW) and the social protection institutions. The social work centres, which are the core units for the implementation of social protection, have the status of an independent legal person, while the MLSP supervises their operation. The Law on Local Self-Government¹³ provides the legal basis for the development of cooperation between the local self-government units and the social work centres at the level of activity, but not for the part concerning the implementation of measures that fall within the competences of the Sector for Social Protection within the MLSP. Presently, there are 30 CSW operating in the Republic of Macedonia, out of which 27 are inter-municipal and three are municipal centres, with the total of 795 employes, 535 (67%) of whom are women.¹⁴

In accordance with the Law on Social Protection and the Law on Execution of the Budget of Republic of Macedonia¹⁵, The Governemnt of RM adopts each year a Programme for Realization of Social Protection, which applies the policies and commitments arising from the strategic priorities for the current year. The Programme governs in greater detail the areas of social work, specific needs of the population and the manner of realization of social protection. The Programme provides for social prevention services and measures, nonresidential and residential social protection for the citizens that are exposed to basic social risks and social welfare for the beneficiaries.¹⁶

10 Law on Social Protection, “Official Gazette of RM” no. 50/97.

11 Social risks are: risks to health (diseases, injuries and bodily disabilities and impairments); age risks (old age and survival); risks pertaining to motherhood and the family; risks of unemployment and inability for professional adaption, and risk of inability of adaptation to the social environment.

12 Law on Social Protection, “Official Gazette of RM” no. 50/97 (Article 5).

13 Law on Self-Government, “Official Gazette of RM” no. 5 from 29.01.2002, Article 22, paragraph 7.

14 Statistical Review: Population and Social Statistics, Social Protection for Children, Youth and Adults in the Republic of Macedonia 2007-2008, State Statistical Office, Skopje, October 2008.

15 Law on Social Protection, “Official Gazette of RM” no. 50/97, Law on Enforcement of the Budget of RM, “Official Gazette of RM” no.166/8.

16 Programme for Realization of Social Protection for 2009, MLSP,<http://mtsp.gov.mk/?ItemID=BD66FCC3A7FBCB47AB9150CBFEC2C96>.

Social welfare is a very important component of the social protection system, through which the state expresses its care and assistance to the most vulnerable categories of citizens. The explicit goals in the field of social welfare refer to poverty reduction (protection of the most impoverished and the high risk categories), as well as improvement of the standards for the exercise of the right to social welfare, in view of prevention of social exclusion. These goals are set forth in the Strategic Planning Document 2007-2009 of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy¹⁷, which provides for a separate programme titled Benefits on the grounds of social protection rights, and a sub-programme on the exercise of social protection rights. The review of documents in the field of social protection, which includes social welfare, indicates that this special Programme still has not been developed. On the other hand, the Programme for Social Protection 2008 and 2009 lacks any provisions on the goals of social welfare.

In accordance with the Law on Social Protection, social welfare includes the following categories: (1) permanent financial allowance for the persons with incapacity for work and for socially endangered persons; (2) social assistance benefit for socially endangered persons with work capacity; (3) financial compensation for assistance and care provided by another person; (4) right to health protection; (5) replacement income for reduced working hours due to care of a child with physical or intellectual disability¹⁸; (6) single payment or assistance in kind; (7) housing benefit and financial allowance for a person who had the status of a child without parents and parental care until 18 years of age.

The scope of our analysis included the first two categories of social welfare listed above: the beneficiaries' right to **permanent financial allowance**, and to a **social assistance benefit**.

The Budget of the Social Protection System in the Republic of Macedonia

The realization of the Programme for Social Protection is planned through three budgets programmes of the MLSP: Programme 2 – Nonresidential Social Protection, Programme 3 – Residential Social Protection, and Programme 4 – Benefits and rights in the sphere of social protection. The last programme referred to above is further divided into two components: Item 433- Transfers to the Healthcare Fund, appropriated for the exercise of the right to health protection for the beneficiaries of social protection, and Item 471- Social Benefits, which, among other rights and services, provides funds for the permanent and social assistance benefits.

The funds for the compensations for the rights to protection of the socially endangered population in the Budget of RM are provided under the sub-programme 41 – Benefits on the grounds of rights to social protection, which is further divided into: a) Item 471 – Social benefits distributed for permanent financial allowance, social assistance benefit, financial compensation for assistance and care provided by another person, replacement income for reduced working hours due to care of a child with physical or intellectual disability, single payment or assistance in kind, housing benefit, financial allowance for a person who had the status of a child without parents and parental care until 18 years of age, reimbursed expenses for accommodation I allowance for care provision within a foster family, accommodation in students' dormitories or other institutions for children without parents and parental care until they become capable of independent living and work, and no later than the completion of secondary education;

¹⁷ The strategic plan of MLSP is available at <http://www.mtsp.gov.mk/WBStorage/Files/strateski.pdf>

¹⁸ The Law on Social Protection of June 2009 defines this right as: "replacement income for reduced working hours due to care of a child with physical or intellectual disability".

b) Item 433 - Transfers to the Healthcare Fund, distributed for the exercise of the right to health protection for beneficiaries of the following social protection rights: permanent financial allowance, placement in foster family, financial compensation for assistance and care provided by another person, financial allowance for a person who had the status of a child without parents and parental care until 18 years of age.

The appropriation of funds intended for social benefits per categories of rights and obligations is carried out in accordance with the Budget of the Republic of Macedonia, with a note that such funds may be amended in accordance with the law, depending on the scope of the rights in the course of the year, so that the total amount of the funds remains unchanged, except by changes and amendments to the Budget rebalance (adopted by the Parliament of the Republic of Macedonia).

Table 1. Total budget of MLSP and budget for benefits on the grounds of social protection rights¹⁹ for the years 2007, 2008, and 2009.

		Total budget of MLSP	Budget for benefits on the grounds of social protection rights	Share of the budget for benefits on the grounds of social protection rights in the total budget of MLSP
2007	Planned	19,575,720,000.00	2,882,000,000.00	14.72 %
2007	Realized	17,936,474,671.00	2,799,139,410.00	15.6 %
2008	Planned	19,251,681,000.00	2,884,410,000.00	14.98 %
2008	Realized	18,091,445,177.00	2,866,909,279.50	15.85 %
2009	Planned	23,962,659,000.00	2,846,000,000.00	11.89 %

*According to the data of MLSP

It is evident that the planned budget for social welfare, within the frames of the budget for benefits on the grounds of social protection rights, has remained rather unchanged in the last three years. In spite of the changes in the total budget of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy (in terms of planned and realized amounts), the payments to the beneficiaries have, to a great extent, remained the same. The decrease of the percentual share of the budget for social welfare in the total budget for 2009 is, in fact, owing to the increase of the total planned budget of the MLSP.

This is also partially due to the operation of the Social Inspection, through which the Ministry carries out an inspection supervision over the implementation and enforcement of laws and other regulations in the field of social protection. Thus, the Report on the operation of the Sector for Inspection Supervision over the enforcement of laws and other regulations in the field of social protection in the year 2008²⁰ on one hand indicated that the total number of beneficiaries decreased for 18,893 (or in absolute figure 8,767) by termination of the exercise of rights on all grounds, which resulted in savings in the budget expenditures amounting to 48,611,185.00 denars. On the other hand, the same report stated that one of the effects of the review was the obligation of the beneficiaries to reimburse the total of 3,928,167.00 denars. This is an obligation imposed on the beneficiaries who received funds without any grounds, i.e., exercised illegally some of the rights to social protection. The above means that the total savings of budget funds for 2008 amounted to 55,399,393.00 denars.

The report also indicates that these savings will have a huge effect in the long

19 Total budget under Programme 41- Benefits and rights in the sphere of social protection, which includes the funds for social welfare for all categories of beneficiaries.

20 The report is available at <http://www.mtsp.gov.mk/WBStorage/Files/godisen.rtf>

run, taking into account the fact that by the decision for termination of the right to social protection, the relevant beneficiary, i.e., the entire family - household is issued the measure of suspension of the exercise of the right to social assistance benefit in the following 6 or 24 months.

It should be noted that despite such savings, the realized budget for 2008 remained within the planned funds for that purpose (Table 1). It is evident that although new beneficiaries replaced the suspended ones, and in spite of the increase of the absolute number of users in several categories, the total savings are stated, but there are no available information or accessible data on how were such funds spent or reallocated.

Table 2. Total budget for benefits on the grounds of social protection rights in comparison to the budgets for the permanent financial allowance and for the social assistance benefit

		Budget for benefits on the grounds of social protection rights	Permanent financial allowance	% of PFA in the total budget	Social assistance benefit	% of SAB in the total budget
2007	<i>Realized</i>	2,799,139,410.00	197,763,713.00	7.06%	1,695,081,330.00	60.56 %
2008	<i>Realized</i>	2,866,909,279.50	215,327,985.00	7.51%	1,594,948,709.00	55.63%
2009	<i>Planned</i>	2,846,000,000.00	200,000,000.00**	7.02%	1,638,000,000.00**	57.55%

*According to the data of MLSP

** Planned under the Programme for Realization of Social Protection for 2009, MLSP

One may also note in the part concerning the appropriation of funds from the budget for benefits on the grounds of social protection rights a continuity in the increase of the amounts allocated to these categories of beneficiaries.

According to the above referred report, the greatest decrease in 2008 was recorded with the beneficiaries of the social assistance benefit, i.e., 13,958 annually (or 8,767 beneficiaries in absolute numbers - holders of the right), and the report also noted that there were 62,295 beneficiaries as of the end of 2007, and 53,528 beneficiaries at the end of 2008. As regards the permanent financial allowance, the report states that the absolute number of beneficiaries of this right (right holders) increased by 204 (i.e., there is a total of 653 beneficiaries), where the number of such beneficiaries was 5,198 in 2008 and 4,994 in 2007.

Furthermore, there are apparent disparities in the data on the number of beneficiaries stated in the Report on the Operation of the Sector for Inspection Supervision over the enforcement of laws and other regulations in the field of social protection in 2008 (which provides a comparative review for the years 2007 and 2008) and the data obtained from the Ministry of Labour And Social Policy (the data on the number of beneficiaries of permanent financial allowance is provided in Table 3, while the data on the number of beneficiaries of social assistance benefit is listed in Table 6) for the same reporting period.

The report provides clarifications about the reasons for the termination of the rights of beneficiaries to social protection, but it fails to include data on the structure, including the gender structure of the beneficiaries who used to receive benefits from one of the categories of social welfare without any grounds.

4.1. DESCRIPTION OF THE RIGHT TO PERMANENT FINANCIAL ALLOWANCE

Title of the social welfare right: Right to permanent financial allowance

Institution in charge of implementation of the social welfare right: MLSP and centres for social work

Goals: The goals of all rights in the sphere of social welfare refer to poverty reduction and prevention of social exclusion. As any other rights, the right to permanent financial allowance is defined through its beneficiaries, i.e., the target groups described below.

Short description of the social welfare right: Taking into account the social character of our state and its commitment to the realization of the principles of humanism and social justice, the right of permanent financial allowance is a continual activity of the competent institutions implementing social protection, from the day the country gained its independence to the present day. The right provides for a cash allowance for persons socially at risk who are incapable of work and are not eligible for any other income benefits under other regulations.

Target groups: In accordance with the Law on Social Protection, the beneficiaries of this type of social welfare are clearly defined six categories of persons who are socially at risk and incapable of work²¹. The persons in question are: persons with moderate, severe and most severe intellectual disabilities, persons with physical disabilities, single mother during pregnancy, one month prior to delivery, single parent up to three years age of the child, childer up to the age of 15 or 26, until it receives regular education, and women and mene above 65 years of age.

The incapacity for work is established by a professional body that makes an assessment of the specific needs of persons with intellectual or physical development up to the age of 26. For persons above the age of 26, the incapacity for work is established by a Professional Commission providing findings, assesments and opinions on the incapacity for work.

A person who is socially at risk shall be a person who has no income or whose household income from all sources is lower than the amount of the permanent financial allowance.

The amount of the permanent financial allowance is fixed to the amount of the average monthly net salary per employee in the Republic of Macedonia realized in the preceding year, where the basic financial allowance for an individual right holder amounts to 20% of the average salary, i.e., 3,219.00 denars, for a right holder with one co-beneficiary it amounts to 28% or 4,507.00 denars, and for a right holder with two or

²¹ In the Law on Social Protection from June 2009, the categories of beneficiaries remain unchanged, but there are changes in the way they are defined. The persons deemed incapable of work shall be persons with: moderate, severe and profound mental impairments and persons with ombined impairments and disabilities, who, due to the degree of the disability cannot obtain education, as well as persons with physical disabilities who do not have the capacity for work, persons suffering mental diseases and persons with permanent changes in the health condition, which render him/her incapable of work, single mother during the pregnancy, one month prior to delivery, and single parent in accordance with the Law on family, with children up to 3 years of age, children without parents or parental care who are not protected on the grounds of their rights to residential care, persons who do not have any income arising from property and holding of property rights, and do not generate income under other regulations, but up to 18 years of age, and persons above the 65 years of age.

more co-beneficiaries it amounts to 40% or 6,438.00 denars²².

Activities and measures (manner and procedure of exercise of the right)

The procedure governing the exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance is similar to the procedure governing other social welfare rights. In particular, the procedure is initiated upon a request by a citizen, i.e., by his/her legal representative, guardian, or ex officio. The centre for social work that with competence for the area of the permanent residence of the applicant decides on the request in the first instance.

The Minister decides upon any complaints against the decision of centre, although such complaint does not stay the enforcement of the decision. The applicant may initiate an administrative proceeding against the second instance decision to the Administrative Court of the Republic of Macedonia.

The review of the available documents in the sphere of social welfare for the beneficiaries indicated the existence of several rulebooks that govern the exercise of specific rights, but not a rulebook that governs the exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance during the reporting period of the present analysis. The exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance used to be governed solely by the Law on Social Protection (1997), which set forth in greater detail the criteria for the exercise of the right and the amount of the allowance. This situation changed by the adoption of a Rulebook on the manner of exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance²³ in September 2009, which would govern this subject matter in the future.

Furthermore, it should be noted that within the framework of the exercise of this right, no priority is given to any of the different categories of beneficiaries. Namely, they are all exposed to specific social risks, and all share equal rights to receive such financial allowance, provided they meet the specific criteria applicable for each risk group.

Potential beneficiaries fill in an application form of the request for exercise/ continuation of the right to social assistance allowance in the centres for social work, where they have to describe the reasons why the request such an assistance and file a comprehensive supporting documentation, which often presents a financial burden for the potential beneficiaries and is rather time consuming.²⁴

22 Social welfare rates, MLSP, <http://www.mtsp.gov.mk/WBStorage/Files/Visinata%20na%20pravata-za%202009g.doc>

23 Rulebook on the manner of exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance, ("Official Gazette of RM" no. 79/09).

24 In accordance with article 4 of the Rulebook on the manner of exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance (September 2009), when applying for permanent financial allowance, depending on the personal financial standing and the standing of family/household members, the applicant shall submit the following documents: photocopy of a valid identity card for the citizens of the Republic of Macedonia, permanent resident permits for aliens, photocopy of identity card for recognized refugees, or photocopy of the identity card for a person under humanitarian and/or subsidiary protection; photocopy of a birth registry certificate; photocopy of a marriage registry certificate; photocopy of a death certificate; certificate for reported or generated net income from the Public Revenue Office; property deed from the Land Surveying Registry; certificate on generated income by virtue of salary; certificates for beneficiaries of old age pension (realized in the Republic of Macedonia or abroad); certificate from the Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia for the unemployed family members; unemployed persons who are not registered with the Employment Agency of RM attaches a list of registered data on the previous length of service; court judgement on legal support. Providing a portion of these documents costs 150-200 denars in the average, and sometimes several documents of the same type are required (for instance, birth registry certificate for all family members), while the remaining documents are issued free of charge or are provided ex officio. If we add up the costs for transport to the relevant institutions (for instance, the relevant centre for social work, Employment Agency, Land Surveying Registry, etc) we may conclude that such costs present a significant financial burden for the potential beneficiaries.

GENDER ANALYSIS OF THE RIGHT TO PERMANENT FINANCIAL ALLOWANCE AND OF THE BUDGET

Beneficiaries of permanent financial allowance

The beneficiaries of the permanent financial assistance are some of the most endangered categories of citizens, who, due to various reasons, are not capable of work and providing for their existence. One cannot help noticing the wide array of different categories of beneficiaries, which includes six different categories of beneficiaries (listed above) ranging from persons with intellectual or physical disabilities, to single mothers during pregnancy and one month following the delivery.

Most likely having in mind the brief duration of such a condition, the policy developers in this sphere provided for restrictions for single mothers in the last month of the pregnancy, as well as for single parents, who are usually women. Namely, there are restriction in the exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance for these two categories of beneficiaries. Despite the fact the scope of the present analysis covers the policies that have been created under the old Law on Social Protection, the same restrictions persist in the new Law on Social Protection²⁵. The single parent is entitled to the allowance in the first three years of the child's life, and only for the first three children in the order of their birth. Such a provision is a restriction that applies both to single parent and their children. The field practice shows that in most of the cases, upon expiry of the three year period, single parents substitute the permanent financial allowance with the social assistance benefit.²⁶ The transfer of single parents from one category to another (from permanent financial allowance to social assistance benefit) does not mean leave the social protection system. It only means that when the child reaches the age of 3, the single parent no longer exercises the right to permanent financial assistance, and if that person still has not provided income sources, it is transferred to another category covered by the social protection system, i.e., the single parent becomes a beneficiary of the social assistance benefit. It should be noted that in the case of such transfers, single parents lose part of the amount that they have received as beneficiaries of permanent financial allowance, having regard to the fact the the amount of the social assistance benefit is significantly smaller. For instance, the permanent financial allowance with one right holder and two or more co-beneficiaries for 2009 amounted to 6,438.00 denars, while the social assistance benefit for a family/ household of three members in the same period amounted to 3,578.00 denars, with a decreasing trend during the period of use (Table no. 6).

At this point we should point out the state's efforts, i.e., the Government's active employment policies which cover the single parents in some of the measures they provide, in order to overcome the single parents' long term dependence on social welfare and improve their economic standing.

Furthermore, in the case of single parents, most often single mothers, under the former Law on Social Protection, alimony used to be considered an income of the household, so that, consequently, the persons of this category were not eligible to receive permanent financial allowance, since they «allegedly» had income. Although the 2008 amendments of the Law introduced changes in this field, article 59 of the new Law on Social Protection (June 2009) provides that a person at financial risk is a person who has no income, or whose income per family member on all grounds

²⁵ Law on Social Protection, "Official Gazette of RM", no. 79, 24 June 2009, Article 66 .

²⁶ The conclusion is based on the practical findings expressed at an unstandardized interview with representative of the Institute for Social Activities, which is the competent authority for supervision of the legality of the operation of professional staff in centres for social work, held on 2 and 18 June 2009.

does not exceed 4000 denars. The Rulebook on the manner of exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance provides for the establishing of the applicant's income on the basis of the income generated from: salary paid in the last three months preceding the filing of the application; pension (realized in the Republic of Macedonia and abroad); cash unemployment benefit, reported or generated net income to the Public Revenue Office; income from financial support in the field of agriculture and rural development, generated in the preceding year; military or civil disability compensation; savings deposits and interest on savings; holding of securities and related income; income generated by temporary work abroad and legal support, where article 2 states as one of the compensations, allowances and benefits that are not considered to be sources of income the legal child support in the amount of 5,000 denars, which is adjusted in January of the current year in line with the increase of the costs of living for the preceding year, according to the statistical data published by the State Statistical Office. Due to the lack of system for monitoring of the compliance with the legal obligation to provide child support, the single parent may be exposed to double difficulties. On one hand, the support may not be paid in due time or at all, while on the other, the applicant may be denied the access to the exercise of this right on the grounds of a court decision providing for the payment of child support.

For this category of beneficiaries, the questions contained in the application form for single parents, issued by the Institute for Social Activities²⁷, are also indicative. In particular, the set of questions referring to single mothers, during pregnancy, one month prior to delivery, the last question states: Is the identity of the father known? The relevance of the question within this context is debatable, since it may have implications on the integrity of the potential beneficiary. One can only presume that this question is related to the issue of alimony, i.e., to the assumption that if the identity of the father is known, the single mother shall generate income on those grounds in the future.

Number of beneficiaries of the right to permanent financial allowance

Due to the lack of structured and systematized data on the beneficiaries, disaggregated according to the grounds for eligibility for this for of social welfare, it is not possible to find out how many of them are, for instance, persons with moderate, severe and most severe intellectual disabilities, or how many of them are single pregnant mothers one month prior to delivery.

Also, there is a lack of gender-disaggregated data. In terms of the gender structure of the beneficiaries, one can only presume that most of the single parents - beneficiaries are women, taking into account the fact the practice has shown so far that women a most often beneficiaries in this category²⁸, as well as those cases where the gender is obvious in view of the grounds for eligibility for the right, such as the case with the single mothers in the last month of the pregnancy. We are dealing with a lack of a system for regular data collection and updating.

However, the experiences of the social workers dealing with these issues within the centres for social work lead to the conclusion that in most of the cases the requests for the exercise of this right were made by men in most of the cases. Such situation is most likely owing to traditional values, level of education, and the awareness of the institutions and rights. Yet, there are also indications that the trends are shifting and as of lately women are more often appearing as applicants. This may be due to the fact that

²⁷ Application form for single parents, Template K.L. - 16.

²⁸ According to the 2002 Census, out of the total number of 38,988 households of single parent with one or more children, 31,074 (79,7%) were households of a single mother with one or more children, while 7,914 (20,3%) were households of a single father with one or more children. This situation is most likely reflected in the number of single parents, beneficiaries of permanent financial allowance.

a lot of husbands go abroad as economic migrants, and their wives fail to report the fact to the centres for social work²⁹.

As mentioned before, MLSP does not have at its disposal gender-disaggregated statistics on the beneficiaries of the permanent financial allowance, which impedes a more comprehensive gender budget analysis of this matter.

The following tables provide a review of the total number of beneficiaries, the total costs and the costs per beneficiary, but, unfortunately, fail at providing a gender-budget analyses, which, in addition to gender, would benefit of data such as those concerning the eligibility grounds, age, ethnic background and place of residence of the beneficiaries.

Table No. 3 Permanent financial allowance: Number of beneficiaries.

Year	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008
Average	5879	4890	4913	4966	5129	5176	5016	4871	5016	5033	5140

Source: MLSP

Table No. 4 Permanent financial allowance: Costs (millions of denars)

Year	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008
Average	12	11	12	13	14	14	15	16	15	16	18

Source: MLSP

Table No. 5 Permanent financial allowance: Cost per beneficiary

Year	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008
Average	2,019.00	2,280.00	2,425.00	2,636.00	2,819.00	2,770.00	3,034.00	3,308.00	3,048.00	3,195.00	3,513.00

Source: MLSP

The tables above provide the monthly averages in the given years.

Table no. 3 leads to the conclusion that the number of beneficiaries is changing from one year to the other. What is particularly evident is the fact that within the period of 10 years, in terms of absolute number of beneficiaries, there is a decrease by 739, i.e., by 12.6%. On the other hand, it is evident that in 2005 the trend of the increase of the number of beneficiaries reappeared. There are no available analytical data that would provide an answer to the question what has caused this condition, and whether it reflects the actual needs of the beneficiaries for such a right.

In addition, Tables 4 and 5 clearly indicate increase in the total costs and costs per user for this type of social welfare. This is due to the manner of calculation of the amounts of the benefits, which are fixed in line with the average salary per employee in the Republic of Macedonia paid in the last three months, and amount to: 20% of the average salary for individual holders of rights, 28% for a right holder with one co-beneficiary, and 40% for a right holder with two co-beneficiaries.

The flowing amounts have been fixed for 2009: 3,219.00 denars for individual right holders, 4,507.00 denars for a right holder with one co-beneficiary, and 6,438.00 denars for a right holder with two co-beneficiaries. The average amount per beneficiary amounts to 4721 denars, which would be the greatest average increase noted so far amounting to 1208 denars.

29 The conclusion is based on the practical findings expressed at an unstandardized interview with representative of the Institute for Social Activities, which is the competent authority for supervision of the legality of the operation of professional staff in centres for social work, held on 2 and 18 June 2009.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

- ◆ There is no system for collection, updating and analysis of data on the beneficiaries of the right to permanent financial allowance. This includes the lack of structured data with disaggregation of beneficiaries according to the eligibility grounds, as well as a lack of disaggregated analytical data in terms of gender, age, education, place of residence, ethnic background. Providing such data on the beneficiaries would provide the policy developers with a clearer picture and enable them to properly quantify the planned activities aimed at different categories of beneficiaries, and with a sound basis for budgeting for this type of social welfare.
- ◆ Therefore, we recommend that all databases established should include data on: eligibility grounds for the exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance, gender, age, education, place of residence, ethnic background of the beneficiaries, as well as possibility for cross-referencing of such data. In addition, such databases should be updated on regular basis so as to provide all stakeholders with a better overview of the situation.

Social policy, in the part concerning social welfare, is not giving sufficient consideration to gender inequalities, which still have deep implications on the citizens' social status.
- ◆ Within this context, there is a necessity of substantial incorporation of the gender perspective in formulation, implementation and impact assessment of the social welfare policies, in order to enable it to meet the different needs and interests of the beneficiaries.

The single parents belong to a vulnerable category which is entitled to exercise this right in the first three years of the child's life, and only for the first three children. As a result of this, its a common practice among the single parents to substitute the permanent financial allowance with the social assistance benefit upon the expiry of the three year period.
- ◆ Systematic efforts are required to amend such provisions that impose restrictions for the single parents and their children, and to introduce specific benefits to facilitate their access to specific services (kindergartens and nurseries). The state should continue and strengthen its endeavours aimed at active inclusion of single parents in the labour market, by virtue of the active employment measures.

The child support, when it exceeds 5000 denars per child, still presents a hindrance to the exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance for the beneficiaries in the category of single parents of children up to 3 years of age.
- ◆ We strongly recommend the annulment of the legal provision stipulating that legal child support (alimony) in the amount exceeding 5000 denars per child is taken into consideration in the assessment of the income of persons who apply for the exercise of the right to permanent financial allowance.
- ◆ The actors involved in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of the effects of social welfare policies, and in particular the CSW employees, who are working directly with the potential and actual beneficiaries of permanent financial allowances, should be particularly sensitized about the gender issues within each of the six different categories of beneficiaries.
- ◆ That would require training for the staff (as well as other measures and instruments) on the specific gender needs, in order to provide for an equal access to services and respect of the integrity of all beneficiaries.

4.2. RIGHT TO SOCIAL ASSISTANCE BENEFIT

Title of the right to social welfare: Right to social assistance benefit

Institution in charge of the implementation of the right to social welfare:
Ministry of Labor and Social Policy and Centers for Social Work

Objectives: As already being mentioned, the objective of all the rights in the field of social welfare is to reduce poverty and prevent social exclusion. Like the other rights, the right to social assistance benefit is as well defined through the beneficiaries, or the target groups described hereafter.

Brief description of the right to social welfare. The social and economic recession aggravated and the creators of the social policy perceived the need for introduction of new category of social welfare, intended for able-bodied citizens who suffered the consequences of the reduced capacity of the society to preserve the existing workplaces and to provide new ones. So as a result of this, in the middle of the 90's of the last century, the right to social assistance benefit was introduced.

Target groups: The right to social assistance benefit can be exercised by able-bodied, socially insecure people, who under some regulations cannot provide basic income.

Activities and measures (manner of implementation of the right and the procedure): The manner of determining the holder of the right to social assistance benefit has been regulated under the Rulebook on the manner of determining the right holder, presenting incomes of a person, family or household when submitting a request for exercising the right and the documentation needed to confirm the income.³⁰

Pursuant to the Rulebook arising from the past Law on Social Protection, the holder of the right to social assistance benefit shall be determined in the following manner: In a household that has one employed person, the holder shall be the employed person; in a household that does not have employed person, but has pension beneficiary – the person that is pension beneficiary shall be the right holder; in a household that does not have employed person or pension beneficiary – then an unemployed person shall be the right holder; in a household that does not have employed person, pension beneficiary or unemployed person but has a person beneficiary of permanent financial assistance - then the right holder shall be the permanent financial assistance beneficiary; and regarding the other households, the competent center for social work shall be the responsible body that will determine which member of the household will be the right holder. The Center for Social Work shall be responsible to determine a person from a family or household to be the right holder in cases when the right holder is not able to fulfill his/her obligations (due to illiteracy, alcoholism, drug addiction, violent behavior, involvement in crimes etc).

According to the Rulebook, the amount of the right to social assistance benefit is determined in percentages compared to the average monthly net salary per employee in the Republic of Macedonia for the previous year. So, the social assistance benefit per person is 13.50%; for family and household with two members - 17.46%; for family and household with three members – 22.23%; for family and household with four members – 28.58%; and for family and household with five or more members - 33.34%. On the other hand, the amount of the social assistance benefit is determined according to the

30 The Rulebook is available at http://www.mtsp.gov.mk/WBStorage/Files/pravilnik_soc.pdf

period for exercise of the right, such as: in the first two years, the right shall be exercised in full amount, in the third, fourth and fifth year only 70% of the determined amount shall be paid, and after the fifth year only 50% of the determined amount shall be paid.

Table no. 6. Amount of the social assistance benefit for 2009

	100%	70%	50%
Person	MKD 2,173.00	MKD 1,521.00	MKD 1,086.50
Family and household consisting of two members	MKD 2,810.50	MKD 1,967.00	MKD 1,405.00
Family and household consisting of three members	MKD 3,578.00	MKD 2,505.50	MKD 1,789.00
Family and household consisting of four members	MKD 4,600.00	MKD 3,220.00	MKD 2,300.50
Family and household consisting of five or more members	MKD 5,366.50	MKD 3,756.50	MKD 2,683.00

Source MLSP

Following the adoption of the Law on Social Protection in June 2009, new parameters have been introduced regarding the determination of the right holder, and the determination of the amount of social assistance benefit depending on the size of the household and the duration of the exercise of this right.

Under this Law, financially insecure person and household shall be a person and household that has incomes lower than the amount of the social assistance benefit and doesn't own property and property rights with which the person or the household can financially support himself/herself/itself. The monthly income per person or household is determined from the average monthly income of all members, realized on different bases in the three succeeding months before the submission of application for exercise of the right to social assistance benefit. The holder of the right to social assistance benefit shall be determined in the following manner: in a household with an employed person – the right holder shall be the employed person; in a household that does not have an employed person, but has pension beneficiary – the right holder shall be the pension beneficiary; in a household that does not have employed person or pension beneficiary – the right holder shall be unemployed person; whereas, regarding other families, the competent center for social work shall be the body that will determine the right holder. The Center for Social Work shall be responsible to determine another person from a family or household to be right holder in cases when the right holder is not able to fulfill his/her obligations (due to illiteracy, drug addiction, violent behavior, involvement in crimes etc).

The amount of the social assistance benefit for the right holder is currently MKD 2,140, and this is considered as basis which is increased per coefficient 0.37 for every additional member of the household (five members at most), and this amount is harmonized with the increase of the living expenses for the previous year, published by the State Statistical Office, in January for the current year.

When it comes to the period for exercise of the right, the determined amount shall be received in the first three years, and afterwards 50% of the amount is provided, which under the past regulations was actually projected to happen after a period of five years of receiving such assistance. ³¹

31 Law on Social Protection, Articles 46, 47 and 48 "Official Gazette of RM" No. 79 from 24 June 2009.

GENDER ANALYSIS OF THE RIGHT TO SOCIAL ASSISTANCE BENEFIT AND THE BUDGET

The policy of social protection witnesses increasing tendency of transition from passive use of social welfare to activation of the welfare beneficiaries. So, Article 55 from the Law on Social Protection from June 2009 determines that the beneficiaries of social assistance benefit can be engaged in performing public works up to 5 days in a month, as well as seasonal works and other temporary works by a mayor of a self-government unit, by public enterprises and public institutions and in meanwhile their right to use social assistance benefit shall not be ceased. The right to social assistance benefit shall not be ceased for the beneficiaries engaged up to five days a month, whereas the right to social assistance benefit of the beneficiaries engaged for seasonal and other works for more than five days shall be suspended during the engagement period, and the right to social assistance benefit shall be reestablished after termination of the engagement. It should be mentioned here that according to Article 55, this provision refers to all categories of beneficiaries, except to retired persons, pregnant women and young mothers, during their maternity leave of 9 months, person incapable to work due to old age, disability or illness, people in working relations, pupils and students.

It should be emphasized that this is a positive provision aimed at protection of the most vulnerable categories of beneficiaries, and it is gender sensitive as well, because it takes into consideration the specific condition of pregnant women and young mothers on 9-month maternity leave.

The legal opportunity for the engagement of beneficiaries of social assistance benefit for performance of public works up to five days in a month, as well as for performance of seasonal works and other temporary works, enables the following: primarily, working engagement of the people and possibility for them to receive amount of compensation bigger than the social assistance benefit amount; secondly, more room is provided for better coordination and cooperation between mayor of local self-government unit, public enterprises and centers for social works. In this context, for instance, if the entities that engage the beneficiaries have gender-divided data, then engagements can be planned within the range of offered seasonal and communal works that do not include solely the traditional “men works” which are related to bigger physical strength. Thus, the women – beneficiaries of the right to social assistance benefit which cannot be exempted from this engagement as a result of pregnancy or maternity leave, would not find themselves in a situation to refuse the engagement which would result in their loss of the right to assistance; and moreover, they can use the possible benefits from the working engagements.

In order to adjust the measures undertaken for activation of the beneficiaries to their needs and capacities, it is very important to know the profile of beneficiaries. On the other hand, proper and exact records are necessary due to the fact that these people are the most numerous beneficiaries for which in the past three years a total of 55% and 60% have been allocated from the total budget for social welfare (see Table 2). Although the MLSP keeps a number of statistics for the social welfare beneficiaries, as the case maybe be with the permanent financial assistance, the statistics is not divided by gender. So, data on different parameters can be obtained which are of great importance when defining this target group, and its targeting for future activation, such as: ethnical origin, economic status of the holder, education, number of years of receiving social assistance; however, the gender statistics cannot still be obtained, which besides

being important for creation of policies aimed at beneficiaries, it is a legal obligation³² as well, and thus it becomes a compulsory aspect in the collection of data. It should be mentioned that despite the efforts made by the Sector for equal opportunities, such data have not been provided till the ending of this analysis!

Before presenting the statistics of MLSP, we will present the available data from the State Statistical Office³³ that include information on the beneficiaries of social assistance benefit, or its holders within household, grouped by gender. The data are for 2004, 2005 and 2006. So, in 2004 only 21% of household holders were women, or 13,803, as opposed to 53,457 men. In 2005, this percentage fell to 19% women as holders of the right to social assistance, or 12,939 as opposed to 53,979 men, and in 2006, the statistics was 13,011 women, or 20%, as opposed to 53,325 men registered as right holders within households.³⁴

Table no. 6 Social assistance benefit: Number of beneficiaries

Year	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008
Average*	49,955	63,812	72,722	74,720	78,654	61,813	64,804	67,113	64,970	64.143	57.687
Average**							67,260	66,918	66,336		
Difference in the number of beneficiaries – SSO - MLSP							2,456	-195	1,366		

*Source MLSP

** Source SSO

Table no. 7 Social assistance benefit: Number of beneficiaries divided by gender

Year	Number of households			Participation in percentage	
	Total	Women	Men	Women	Men
2004	67,260	13,803	53,457	21%	79%
2005	66,918	12,939	53,979	19 %	81%
2006	66,336	13,011	53,325	20 %	80 %

Source SSO

Table no. 8 Social assistance benefit: Total expenses (in million MKD) and expenses per beneficiary (in thousands MKD)

Year	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008
Average of total expenses	152	197	195	184	189	139	139	147	140	142	132
Expenses per beneficiary	3,048.00	3,094.00	2,677.00	2,457.00	2,403.00	2,246.00	2,149.00	2,186.00	2,158.00	2,207.00	/

Source: MLSP

The tendency of reduction of the number of beneficiaries of permanent assistance benefit has been present for the last ten years, and when it comes to the average monthly number of beneficiaries of social assistance benefit, it can be observed that in 2008, the number is smaller compared to the one in the previous year and the

³² The Law on Equal Opportunities, "Official Gazette of RM", No. 66 of 29.05.2006, Article 20, the Assembly, the Assembly, the Government, the bodies of state administration, the bodies of the judiciary and the other state bodies, the bodies of the units of local self-government, the legal entities which have been confided by law to perform activities of public interest, the citizen associations, the foundations, the public companies, the educational institutions, the institutions in the field of social protection, the medical institutions, the political parties, the media, the companies, and the other entities that are obligated by law to collect, record and work with statistical data are obliged to present this data on human resources in accordance to gender affiliation.

³³ *Women and men in Macedonia*, State Statistical Office, Skopje, 2008.

³⁴ This review is presented in Table 6 (which also presents the difference in the number of beneficiaries according to SSO and according to MLSP) and Table 7.

years with the highest average. However, the average number of beneficiaries is still bigger than the average number of beneficiaries from 10 years ago. Namely, in 2008 there were 57,687 beneficiaries compared to 49,955 beneficiaries in 1998, which is an increase of 7,732 social assistance beneficiaries, or 13.4%. This leads us to the conclusion that if we take the number of beneficiaries of social assistance benefit as an indicator that shows the situation of able-bodied population, then the social situation is much worse today than it was in 1998. On the other hand, it can be observed that the total average expenses allocated for social assistance benefit, as well as the average monthly amounts for the beneficiaries are showing tendency of decrease. This is probably due to the increasing number of beneficiaries that have been using the right to social assistance benefit for a longer period, which causes reduction of the principal amount. So, according to the data from MLSP, in 2007, 35.7% of the beneficiaries had already been exercising this right for more than six years. This shows that the efforts to activate socially insecure able-bodied population should be strengthened and directed towards inclusion of these people in the labor market.

On the other hand, if we put this in the context of gender issues the smaller representation of women holders of this right is obvious.

As an illustration, we intercrossed the data from the State Statistical Office on the number of beneficiaries divided by gender (although there is a difference with the data received from MLSP, presented in Table 6, which would cause implications in the total budget for this kind of assistance) with the average paid amounts for 2004, 2005 and 2006, presented in Table 9.

Table 10 Summary/Illustration of the average paid amounts for social assistance benefit for 2004, 2005 and 2006, Gender segregation

Year	Expenses per beneficiary	Number of households/ Total expenses per right holder per gender					Participation in percentage	
		Total	Women	expenses	Men	expenses	Women	Men
2004	2,149.00	67,260	13,803	29,662,647.00	53,457	114,879,093.00	21%	79%
2005	2,186.00	66,918	12,939	28,284,654.00	53,979	114,867,312.00	19 %	81%
2006	2,158.00	66,336	13,011	28,077,738.00	53,325	115,075,350.00	20 %	80 %

Although we are aware that such review causes changes in the total expenses paid for this type of assistance (around MKD 5,000,000 for 2004, decrease for about MKD 1,000,000 in 2005, and increase for around 3 million MKD in 2006) its aim is to present the huge difference between the holders of social assistance benefit when it comes to the gender structure.

Since men and women equally feel the burden of poverty, we should be concerned with this difference that raises the question how can the percentage of women holders of the right to social assistance benefit be so low. Whether this is due to the traditional role of men as providers of finances for the family, or maybe women do not accept this additional responsibility due to preoccupation with home activities. This can be supported with part of the analysis on the conducted survey³⁵ that refers to the female and male attitudes when it comes to lack of incomes. Namely, men are more willing to engage themselves in additional works, unlike women who are traditionally willing to reduce their expenses. Hence, the presumption that in some cases women would better manage smaller means for subsistence.

We should mention the complex procedure and extensive documentation

35 *Early Warning Report*, UNDP, 2007.

and the need for frequent visits to the CSW, which are quite time-consuming for the right holders. Namely, the publication *On the road to EU*, the procedure for obtaining social assistance benefits in all regions of the country is described as extensive and difficult procedure. "Extensive in the sense of the necessary documentation that has to be submitted for the acquisition of social assistance and difficult due to the financial means needed for collection of the necessary documentation that is often described as expense equivalent to the amount of the social assistance benefit which is required and there are some additional unpredicted conditions, such as: not having motor vehicle, probate proceedings, receiving alimony etc."³⁶

In order to discover the reasons for the obvious gender disparity in the number of beneficiaries, we will briefly refer to the Rulebook used for determining the holder of the right to social assistance benefit and its order (in the period between 2004 and 2006). The Center for Social Work determines a holder only for a household that does not include a holder who is employed person; member that receives pension; person who is not employed; or holder of right to permanent assistance benefit, as well as in cases when the right holder cannot fulfill his/her obligations (due to illiteracy, alcoholism, drug addiction, violent behavior, participation in crimes etc). This clearly shows the position of the women in households that need social assistance benefit. If the percentage of women as right holders in the period between 2004 and 2006 is between 19% and 21%, this brings us to the conclusion that in most families women are not employed, retired or unemployed. The available data from MLSP for the financial status of the right holder show that in 2005, the percentages of the holders was the following: 3.1% employed persons, 0,1% retired persons and 93.5% registered unemployed persons. For 2005 there were no beneficiaries of permanent assistance benefit that were holders of this right, and 3.3% were other holders. In 2006³⁷, 2% were employed holders, no retired persons, 97.2% registered unemployed persons, 0.1% beneficiaries of permanent financial benefit and 2.9% other holders. The fact that the number of unemployed persons who are holders was 95% in 2006, only confirms the thesis of traditional roles of women and men in family, in other words, even when both genders suffer the burden of poverty the roles are divided differently.

However, although there is no empirical awareness for the reasons for obvious differences in the gender structure of the holders of social assistance benefit, the figures show that men and women do not have equal access as holders of such right. Activities should be taken in this direction towards balanced determination of holders of the right to social assistance benefit. Moreover, Article 7 from the Rulebook on social assistance benefit from September 2009 determines that unless there is an employed person, the right holder should prove his/her status of unemployed person and the status of the members of his/her household. This means that, for example if married couple is in question, the spouses should be regularly registered as unemployed. This raises the question of gender sensibility of the employees in CSW who are in direct communication with the potential beneficiaries and should recognize the importance of the gender dimensions in such cases. Namely, even though the whole family should subsist with the realization of this right, the access to these means belongs to the right holder (in other words, the means arrive on his/her name and only the holder can withdraw them), and there are no available data on the distribution of these means within the family.

³⁶ On the road to EU, Contribution of the civil society in the creation of social inclusion policy in Republic of Macedonia, MLSP, 2008.

³⁷ Although the MLSP has at its disposal such data for 2007 as well, the data shall not be taken into consideration since the data of the SSO about right holders divided by gender is available only for the period 2004-2006.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

- ◆ The great gender disparity among social assistance beneficiaries brings us to the conclusion that women and men don't have equal access as holders of the right to social assistance benefit
- ◆ In order to overcome this situation, the employees in the centers for social work should have highly developed awareness of the gender component when making decisions. The personnel of CSW should be trained in order to determine the right holder in a rightful manner and the training should be aimed at underlining specific gender issues in registered and potential families – beneficiaries.
- ◆ The Law on Social Protection forms the foundations for passing from passive usage of social assistance to activation of the social assistance beneficiaries.
- ◆ In order to adjust the undertaken measures to the needs and capacities of the beneficiaries, provision of gender-divided data is necessary.
- ◆ Although there are some data on social assistance beneficiaries organized according to different parameters which are of exceptional importance, such as: ethnical origin, economic status of the holder, education, and number of years of receiving social assistance, there is no statistics based on gender. On the other hand, there is a huge lack of analytical data about the profile of social assistance beneficiaries. We call for further researches that should contribute to defining the profile of target groups, detecting the gender needs and interests of the beneficiaries, for the purpose of creating a surrounding with equal opportunities for all citizens.
- ◆ Employment policies should greatly provide speedier integration on the labor market for the beneficiaries of social assistance benefit.
In that respect, cooperation and coordination between the competent institutions included in this process is necessary, in order to enable balanced access to working engagements to women and men.
- ◆ There is a legal opportunity for the engagement of beneficiaries of social assistance benefits for performance of public works up to five days in a month, as well as for performance of seasonal jobs and other temporary jobs.
Taking this into consideration, we recommend maximum coordination between mayors of local self-government units, public enterprises and the social work centers, with a view to anticipate within the range of offered seasonal and communal jobs, engagements which would not cover mainly traditional "men's work" related to use of greater physical strength, and thus women beneficiaries of the right to social assistance, who are not exempt from this engagement as a result of pregnancy or maternity leave, would have equal treatment as men.

ACTIVE EMPLOYMENT POLICIES

The approaching of the Republic of Macedonia towards EU imposes certain standards and qualities in all areas of society and especially in the field of employment and education, and these standards and qualities should be fulfilled by the Republic of Macedonia in the coming period.

The standards and the qualities in the field of employment and education that should provide economic and social reforms as part of the positive strategies for improvement of the situation with the employment, the competitiveness and the social cohesion in Europe are defined in many charters, strategies and documents. To us, the most important charters are the charters in which the promotion of equal opportunities is integral concept of the policies of EU member states and the initiatives are directed towards overcoming the existing (in)equalities: the Charter of Amsterdam, the Lisbon Strategy and the European Employment Strategy.

So, overturn was made in the field of employment when the EU member states presented the problem of unemployment in the Treaty of Amsterdam in 1997 as an "European" problem, pointing out that this problem should be solved on member states level, because it cannot be solved only on national level due to its proportions. The common concern is expressed in Article 126 under which the member states are obliged to work on the development of coordinated employment strategy and labor market skills, which would be flexible to economic changes. The gender issues contained in the Treaty of Amsterdam define equal opportunities and elimination of inequalities on the labor market and in employment processes, including the principles of equal salaries for equal work, in other words for work with equal value.

The European Employment Strategy (EES), which was adopted the same year, is based on four pillars: employability, entrepreneurship, adaptability and equal opportunities. Additionally, EES is being developed as a sum of principles that should be incorporated by each member state in the annual national reform programmes (NRP), previously defined as national employment action plans (NAP).

Once again, in the direction of improving the employability and building knowledge-based economy, as a response to the situation in EU in 2000, which translated in figures means 15 million unemployed Europeans, on the session of the Council of Europe in Lisbon (March 2000), the European Union adopted the Lisbon Declaration with new strategic objectives: to become the most competent and dynamic knowledge-based economy that will be capable to provide sustainable economic prosperity with more and better working posts and better social cohesion.

As indicator for measuring the success, the Council defined increase rate of employment of 70% and increase of the number of women in the working process for more than 60% up till 2010. The reason for such defined indicators result from the employment rate, which is low and characterized with insufficient representation of women and elderly workers on the labor market, and the development of IT technologies, which can lead to bigger discrepancy when it comes to the skills on the labor market.

In the process of approaching the EU, Republic of Macedonia has so far shown willingness and political readiness for promotion of the European standards and values

through increasing the employability of the unemployed and their active participation on the labor market, with the measures used within the Active Labor Market Policies (ALMP), whose aim is to increase the participation of the working force and reduce the number of inactive beneficiaries of social services (unlike the passive measures that cover the social benefits, compensations in case of unemployment and early retirement).³⁸

The active employment policies, for which funds have been allocated (in 2007 0.08% of GDP, in 2008-0.16% and in 2009-0.28%), should help in dealing with unemployment, creating dynamic economy and investing in human capital, as well as in increasing the employment rate among women.

GENDER ISSUES IN RM EMPLOYMENT POLICIES AND STRATEGIES

The Republic of Macedonia is joining the European initiatives with aspirations and efforts to ensure integration of all able bodied people into the labour market, activation of the citizens, reduction of unemployment, investing in human capital and creation of country of welfare for its citizens.

In the context of integration of gender concepts in employment policies, in accordance with EU treaties, standards and good practices, the Republic of Macedonia, as well, makes efforts for their integration and implementation in all strategic and program documents of the country.

Hereinafter we shall depict all the key documents promoting the principles of equality and equal access to employment policies.

The principal document and framework that defines the employment policies is the National Employment Strategy 2010 (NES), a document adopted by the Government of the Republic of Macedonia. It includes the employment policies of the revised Lisbon Strategy and EU Guidelines and defines its objectives, among them being increase of the employment rate among the women in the Republic of Macedonia from 30.1% in 2005 to 38% in 2010.

The manners of realization of these objectives are explained in the same document (Chapter 2.6.3. Equal opportunities for men and women); and these manners are (1) continuation of the process of harmonization and alignment of Macedonian legislation with EU legislation in the field of equal opportunities; (2) drafting of education and training programs with more active participation of women that would create more opportunities for their employment even in sectors where they are less present; (3) reforms for small and medium size companies and stimulation of entrepreneurship among women; (4) promotion and development of the network of public and private facilities for child care that would increase the percentage of socially protected children up till their age for mandatory education.

The next key document whose objective is to provide implementation of the Employment Strategy 2010 is the National Employment Action Plan (NEAP) 2006-2008.

³⁸ According to the data from EARM for 2007 and 2008, only 80% of the total registered unemployed people are actively looking for a job. In 2007, out of 357166 registered people, 75508 people register only to use the right to healthcare protection, and 281658 (80.1%) are actively searching for a job. In 2008, out of 343363 registered people, 71587 people register only to use the right to healthcare protection, and 271774 (79.2%) are actively searching for a job. In 2009 out of 349879 registered people, 71235 people register solely to use the right to healthcare protection, and 278644 (79.6%) are actively looking for a job. Review of the unemployed people registered in the Employment Agency of RM. Table 4: registered unemployed people from 01.01.2007 to 31.12.2007, 01.01.2008 to 31.12.2008 and by the end of April 2009. (www.avrm.mk)

With the analysis of the situation, regarding the position of women, it was concluded that there had been some positive tendencies with the increase of the number of employed women and the “difference in the unemployment rates between women and men, is among other things, due to the absence of activities among women from Albanian, Roma and Turkish nationality. The objectives of this document are directed towards increase of the employment among women up to 38% by 2010.

When it comes to the part of employment policies and gender issues, the **National Employment Action Plan (NEAP) 2009-2010** is a kind of continuation of the NEAP (2006-2008). It contains short overview of the achievements of the Operational Program 2007 and 2008 and the objectives of the strategy – the employment rate among women to be increased to 38% by 2010. It is stated in the document, as well as in the previous NEAP, that the rate of inactive women is higher among the women from the Albanian, Roma and Turkish ethnic community. The planned activities indicate that the operational programs will include a larger number of women within individual programs and employment measures. The National Action Plan makes reference to the Operational Program for Human Resources Development 2007-2013, Component 4 from the Instrument for Pre-Accession Assistance (IPA), which will support measures whose objective would be elimination of inequalities and promotion of equal opportunities for men and women. Furthermore, NEAP 2009-2010 in the planned activities mentions range of measures and activities for improvement of the position of women on the labor market, part of the National Strategy on Gender Equality, or the National Action Plan for Gender Equality (NAPGE).

The National Action Plan on Gender Equality (NAPGE) is based on the motto of the Beijing Declaration which invites the governments to include gender equality in mainstreams, policies, programs and practices, and before making decisions to make analysis on the effect of such decisions on women and men.

NAPGE refers to use of the so-called dual track approach, which is actually corrective approach or model of essential equality, which does not deal only with equal opportunities, but more with fairness of results and does not focus on equal treatment, but on equal treatment and equal benefits.

One of the ten strategic action fields of NAPGE is Women and employment, which is sixth strategic area. This program is as well directed towards improvement of employability among women in accordance with the strategic documents.

By obtaining the candidate status for EU membership, the Republic of Macedonia became eligible for EU Pre-Accession Funds. These funds are intended to be used for strengthening and development of the administrative capacities and achievement of EU standards in certain areas. The forth or the five components, which is relevant for this topic, is the **Operational Program for Human Resources Development (OPHRD 2007-2013)** with total funds of MKD 55,000,000,000, compatible with the guidelines from the European Social Fund (ESF).

The program contains three main objectives: increasing employability, reducing unemployment and keeping people on the labor market through improvement of the labor market functioning and employment opportunities, particularly for vulnerable groups (young people, women and people who have been unemployed for longer period, elderly people, ethnical communities, etc).

On the basis of the consultative processes on OPHRD for the period 2007-2013, it is said that the program included suggestions on inclusion of women, improvement of

social and economic analysis and thorough gender analysis, as well as suggestions on broadening the scope of the existing activities for women.

We hope that the findings from this research will in a way contribute to more efficient planning and usage of IPA funds for this component and will provide equal access to men and women to opportunities, and equal distribution of the benefits from these instruments.

MEASURES IN EMPLOYMENT POLICIES

The active employment policies are realized through range of programs and measures (Table no. 12) drafted and implemented by a number of institutions, among them being the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy (MLSP), the Employment Agency of RM (EARM), through the employment centers, the Agency for Promotion of Entrepreneurship (APERM) etc.; funds for these policies are being provided from the budget of the country as well as from the international organizations UNDP and USAID.

The table below provides an overview of the all the active employment policy measures. The subject of analysis in this segment of research are gender issues and budgetary aspects in the four active employment policy measures: Self Employment, Formalisation of Existing Businesses, Subsidisation of Employment and Preapration for Employment during a two year period 2008-2009 (including certain indications for 2009).

Table 12. Review of the programs of the active employment policies (AEP) planned and spent finances for every program.

Program type	2007 Program Budget	2008 Program Budget	2009 Program Budget	Participation in the total budget of MLSP (in %)		
				2007	2008	2009
Self-employment program	73,000,000.00 planned 99,506,409.00 realized	97,236,600.00 planned 102,487,500.00 realized	122,407,300.00 planned	0.37 0.54	0.51 0.54	0.53 -
Program for formalization of existing businesses	-	18,136,500.00 planned 19,153,500.00 realized	47,000,000.00 planned	-	0.09 0.10	0.20 -
Program for preparation for employment	-	61,363,600.00 planned 50,776,000 realized	21,546,560.00 planned	-	0.32 0.27	0.93 -
Program for subsidizing employment	111,800,000.00 planned 76,338,400.00 realized	110,150,000.00 planned 94,436,000.00 realized	339,006,000.00 planned	0.57 0.41	0.57 2.70	1.46 -
Traineeship program	-	360,000,000.00 planned 1,692,000.00 realized	13,500,000.00 planned	-	1.87 0.00	0.06 -
Active employment programs (local infrastructure) public works in local self-government units (LSGU)	27,600,000.00 planned 19,797,915.00 realized	-	228,980,000.00 planned	0.14 0.11	-	-

Engagement of unemployed persons from underdeveloped regions in performing construction works, environmental projects etc.	19,000,000.00 planned 20,180,970.00 realized	-	-	0.10	-	-
Trainings and consultations for unemployed people, retraining, computer course etc.	50,000,000.00 planned 50,000,000.00 realized	-	-	0.26 0.26	-	-
Pilot survey for vacancies	-	-	730,000,000.00 planned	-	-	3.15 -
Improving the economic situation of women victims to domestic violence	-	-	35,000,000.00 planned	-	-	0.15 -
Program for support of employment of Roma people	-	-	4,800,000.00 planned	-	-	0.02 -

Table No.12a. is an overview of finances for active employment policies for the period 2007-2009, and small growth can be noticed in the finances for implementation of these policies.

Table No.12a. Review of total planned employments – engagements and planned and spent finances with the active employment policies (AEP).

Year	Planned - Realized employments	The total budget of MLSP	AEP Budget	Participation of AEP in the total budget of MLSP in %
2007	Planned	19,575,720,000.00	297,600,000.00	1.52
2007	Realized	18,413,733,633.00	265,823,779.00	1.44
2008	Planned	19,251,681,000.00	294,191,921.00	1.53
2008	Realized	18,810,076,840.00	275,560,821.00	1.47
2009	Planned	23,205,711,000.00	825,102,860.00	3.56

Source: MLSP, Accounting Department, Review of planned employments-engagements and planned and spent finances with active employment programs (28.7.2009).

Note: The data for 2007 and 2008 do not include the employment programs for Roma people.

The budget for AEP includes finances from donations and the agencies responsible for implementation of these programs, the EARM and APERM.

Subject to analysis in this part of the research are the gender issues and the budget aspects in the four measures of the active employment policies: self-employment, formalization of existing businesses, subsidizing employment and preparation for employment in a period of two years 2007 and 2008 (with certain indications for 2009)

Taking into consideration that the budget is operational part of the public policies with gender analysis and gender-budget analysis, we actually wanted to establish how much the public policies are gender sensitive and to what extent the principal provisions on gender equality, contained in all strategic and operational documents, are followed with allocation of adequate budget means.

And, what is essential, whether the measures in practice fulfill the expectation from gender aspect, in accordance with the expressed political will and the adopted (accepted) legal provisions and strategic documents.

5.1 SELF-EMPLOYMENT PROGRAM

Program title:

SELF-EMPLOYMENT PROGRAM (FAMILY BUSINESS, initiated in 2007, realized in 2007, 2008 and 2009)

Institution in charge of project implementation

The Ministry of Labor and Social Policy (MLSP), the Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (EARM), the Central Registry (CR), the Agency for Promotion of Entrepreneurship (APE) of the Republic of Macedonia (APERM), UNDP.

Objectives (explicit and implicit)

The objectives of the SELF-EMPLOYMENT PROGRAM for 2007, 2008 and 2009 are directed towards reduction of poverty and unemployment through starting new businesses. Indirect objective is to create 500 self-employments/family businesses in 2007, 600 self-employments/family businesses in 2008 and 600 self-employments/family businesses in 2009.

Brief description

The programs are realized through trainings for the interested unemployed people on entrepreneurship, preparation of business plans, assistance in registration of own business and subsidies for starting business. The objectives of the Program remained unchanged in the course of the three years, whereas the selection process was changed in the first year compared to the second and third year, as explained hereunder.

Target groups

The target groups of the Self-employment Program are defined within the operational plans for 2008 and 2009. This measure projects inclusion of: (1) 250 young unemployed people up to the age of 27; (2) unemployed women, being registered in EARM for more than one year (100 women in 2008 and 150 women in 2009); and (3) long-term unemployed people, being registered in EARM for more than two years, 150 long-term unemployed people in 2008 and 200 long-term unemployed people in 2009)³⁹

This measure, for 2007, projected inclusion of people from undeveloped areas, long-term unemployed people (for more than 5 years), beneficiaries of financial assistance on the basis of unemployment and young people up to the age of 27. Women as target group are not mentioned in the Operational plans for 2007.

Additionally, the Operational program for 2008 and 2009 clearly defines the determinations for larger inclusion of women from ethnic communities, in accordance with the other strategic documents.

Activities and measures

The measures in this program refer to: preparation of individual plans for employment; performance of tests for professional orientation; development of business ideas; selection of the most eligible and interested candidates; trainings for entrepreneurship; drafting business plans, in cooperation with APERM; marketing; covering expenses for procurement of equipment or other basic means for starting business; financial participation in the expenses for registration of a firm; financial participation in the contributions for salary in the first three months; support through

³⁹ There is no exact defined scope of beneficiaries for 2007.

trainings, provision of advice and other information throughout the first year by APERM, and all of this has been explained in the operational plans.

The implementation of this program shall be performed through the regional center of the Employment Agency of RM. The financial support is EUR 2,500 of non-refundable funds per employment.

GENDER BUDGET ANALYSIS PROCESS:

Selection process

The Self Employment Program is conducted through three main stages and 12 steps that contain the preparation process, the selection of candidates, implementation and evaluation of the program: The stages explained in Operating Direction on Operationalization of Self Employment as a part of the Operating Plan for active policies and employment in 2007 concern: (1) promotion, adoption and selection of participants; (2) training and selection of the best business plans and ideas and companies registration, and (3) providing initial grant for procurement of goods/equipment⁴⁰.

The steps, defined in the Operating directions, as essential documents which explain the overall selection process of the candidates, for three years (2007, 2008 and 2009) include: (1) Preparation of the Operating Directions; (2) Public Announcement; (3) Registration of the applications by the employment centre and initial selection according to target groups; (4) Informing candidates for repair, and sign a declaration of consent for participating in the project; (5) Training "from idea to business"; (6) Advisory system through vouchers for preparing business plans; (7) Ranking the top 500 business plans which will receive grants for Self Employment; (8) Registration of the family business and the employments; (9) Signing the contracts for the grants in the form of equipment; (10) Purchase of equipment/reproductive materials for the self employed person; (11) Participation of the contributions in a period of three months for each self employed person; (12) Program Evaluation.

In addition, the analysis will address the ways in which the gender aspects are integrated into these steps and their implication in the processes of implementation and monitoring of the program.

(1) The first essential step from the aspect of integration of gender questions is the preparation of **Operating directions for operationalization of the measures included in the operating plans.**

The operating directions for operationalization of the measures included in the operating plans represent a strategy document where the methodology, the activities, the conduct and the evaluation criteria of candidates of the Self Employment Program are defined. These directions jointly determine the institutions responsible for their further implementation MLSA, EARM, APERM (Agency for Promotion of Entrepreneurship of RM) and UNDP.

After they are defined, the operating directions are delivered to the employment centers, in charge of further processes of treatment and selection of candidates.

The analysis of the operating plans and directions for 2007 confirmed that the gender questions or specific measures directed towards women as a target group are not included despite the fact that the government strategy documents point out their importance in creating employment measures. The only encouraging measure is

⁴⁰ Operationalization of Self Employment as a part of the Operating Plan for active Self Employment policies for 2007 of the Government of the Republic of Macedonia, Operating Guidelines, 2007.

the milestone contained in the operating directions for operationalization of measures (2007), the Chapter, Selection of Candidates says: “women applicants included in the framework of the border cases will be prioritized”

Although this formulation is crucial and improves the transparency of the gender aspects in employment policies, still is not enough to provide equal participation of women and equal budget distribution and use of this policy. The additional steps of the way in which this standard will be operationalized in practice are not contained in the Operating Directions and in other operating documents.

Certain progress can be identified in the operative plans for 2008 and 2009, where the women are defined as special target group, along with the rest two target groups, the youth and the long-term unemployed, and the benchmark on “prioritizing women” was left out.

The women from the ethnic communities are mentioned as a critical target group, but no additional measures are envisaged for their encouragement and participation in the labor market.

The implications and gains from these measures will be explained further in the analysis.

(2) The second step is public announcement

Presuming that the communication processes with the potential users, are essential as a tool for successful implementation and application of the possibilities offered by the active policy measures for employment, our main interest was to understand the depth of the approach about informing different categories of users, including the question for using gender – sensitive language in communication.

The operating directions define the ways and procedures for advertising and information, and our interlocutors confirmed the efforts of the Employment Centers (30 centers) taken in the direction of finding a better way of informing the citizens about the opportunities offered by the measures of active employment policy.

Multiple announcements are published in various media in Macedonian and Albanian. Despite the announcements, all employment centers publish their measures on a bulletin board in their premises, issue notices, organize public appearances in the local media explaining the application process, and various others notifications, information, advertising material etc.

In the public announcements, those in 2008 and 2009, women are separated as a special target group. We believe that this approach is extremely important in the direction of public’s sensitivity, identifying the category women as potential beneficiary of the measures, but also their encouragement to answer the public announcement.

Still the dilemma of whether this information measures will be enough to encourage and stimulate potential users exist, especially the inactive ones, to take part in the labor market, and influence people from different classes and categories, including the ethnic communities.

The Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs Reports indicate that the response of public announcement’s users in certain situations was inadequate and additional measures were taken, including the time for extension of the announcement. This encourages us to propose activities aimed at creating a more comprehensive information strategy, which will cover also the population with limited or nonexistent access to

modern information tools.

(3) The third step, applicants' registration by the employment centers and initial selection by target groups, is completed in the employment centers (30) in the Republic of Macedonia.

The registration and candidate selection procedure for employment in 2008 and 2009, is conducted through self evaluation questionnaire⁴¹ encompassing several group criteria: (1) group criteria for disqualification where the beneficiaries have the possibility to qualify for one of the predefined target groups – long term unemployed⁴², unemployed women and young unemployed persons under 27; (2) group of questions for identification of the preliminary skills and capabilities; (3) group of questions for identification of the entrepreneurial aspirations.

At the beginning, in the registration process, the applicant, independently and mandatorily will choose one of the target groups to which he belongs, and thus prove his membership. In this phase of the application process, the ethnicity question.

Basically, the target groups defined in this way are broad enough to include almost all interested candidates. Only the category long term unemployed persons (more than 1 year) make up 79,7% from the total number of registered unemployed persons⁴³.

In a situation when there will be candidates which will be able to apply in all three categories of target groups (for example, a 27 years old, unemployed female, registered in the EARM more than a year), they select one target group, then depending on the beneficiaries interest, can be transferred into other appropriate categories of target groups.

The second and the third group of selection questions refer to the identification of the preliminary skills and abilities, and entrepreneurial aspirations of the candidates. The questionnaires are based on choosing the correct answer from multiple choices, answers that later determine the candidates eligibility to participate in the further selection procedure.

The second and the third group of questions don't contain provisory or encouraging measures with which the predefined target groups will enjoy certain privileges⁴⁴.

On the other hand, although we don't know the evaluation of the answers in the questionnaire, we refer to some sensible aspects in the application of the predefined selection instruments. Namely, the ways in which individuals (young women, men, long term unemployed, representatives of various ethnical groups) have an understanding or are dealt with certain situations and conditions in life, stated in the questionnaire, differ and depend on various psychological, economical and social factors material (in) security, the degree of confidence, perception, finances and other recourses (land, property etc.,) etc.

41 This questionnaire is a software solution in which each question, depending on how it is answered, is worth a number of points.

42 In the Operating Program for 2009, the conditions are changed and as long-term unemployed are defined those registered unemployed for more than a year. The same applies to the category of women.

43 National Report from the analysis of the demand of skills of the labor market in Macedonia for 2008, Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia, Skopje, June 2008.

44 Such practice of the use of encouraging measures exists only in the case of unemployed people living in underdeveloped areas in 2007, established upon the Decision of the Government, published in Official Gazette 17/2006. *Belonging to this category of users in the process of selection brings extra points.*

Therefore, we can conclude that, belonging to certain target group and/or ethnicity in the initial, but also in the further selection processes does not influence the final output, nor the range of beneficiaries. Of course, it does have certain influence towards the strengthening the awareness for certain marginal and critical categories of target groups (adults, long term unemployed, women, women from the ethnical communities, young etc.) and transparency in the employment policies,

(4/5) The fourth and the fifth step consist of informing the candidates for the measure and signing a statement of consent for participation in the project **Entrepreneurship Training “From Idea to Business”**.

Candidates that passed the third step are directed to the employment centers for entrepreneurship training. According to the results published in the APERM, the beneficiaries evaluated the training as successful. The trainings are evaluated as successful by the beneficiaries⁴⁵. The candidates, that after the completion of the training, want to take further actions and start their own business or to register a company, move to the next stage, using the voucher system for preparation of business plan.

After the initial selection of the candidates, the selection process continues in this stage also. A Selection Commission, composed of representatives from the institutions included in the implementation of the program, based on previously determined conditions and criteria decides which of the candidates proceed in the next level.

In this stage, also, there are no encouraging measures for certain categories of beneficiaries, especially for women in ranking and candidate selection. The Commissions and the trainers in charged for the selection perform the selection based on previously agreed criteria for which there are no gender sensitive indicators and issues about inequality.

The information received during the interviews show that one part from the potential beneficiaries, dropped out during or after the end of the training from further participation in the program. The reasons for that differ; discouragement, fear of failure, lack of readiness to fulfill the obligations and responsibilities which they'll face on the labor market etc. However, the systematic evidence and the qualitative analysis of the reasons for this decision, especially among different groups of beneficiaries, which can be critical in the adjustment and the improvement the policies, are not implemented.

According to the analysis of Self Employment Project Success Report, 2007 with draft measures for improvement, the entrepreneurial counseling is evaluated as very successful and increased the enlargement of the company. The beneficiaries expressed readiness, in significant number, to participate with their own resources in the counseling part.

This has encouraged us in the recommendations to propose even more intense measures for support trough training and counseling of the beneficiaries, not only in the process of registration and starting a business, but also in the further developmental activities.

(6/7) The sixth and the seventh step are: **advisory system trough vouchers for preparation of business plans and ranking of the 500 best business plans** which will receive self employment grants;

⁴⁵ Report from the analysis of the success of Self Employment Project, 2007 with a proposal of measures for improvement, APERM, March 2008.

After the successfully conducted entrepreneurship training “From Idea to Business”, the candidates are directed to voucher counseling in the six regional centers Organizations for Business Support. From the existent Catalogue of Councilors (selected at public announcement) certified consultants are selected for preparation of business plans and/or registration.

Once the business plans, with the cooperation of the consultants, are prepared, the ranking is performed by the Commission of Experts, in charged for the preparation of list with the prioritized business plans.

Here, the evaluation principle is market oriented (only the economic viability and sustainability of the business plans are evaluated), without considering the different categories of beneficiaries covered with the measures.

From the overall selection procedure of the candidates, before mentioned, we can conclude that for the beneficiaries divided into target groups, targeted by the employment policies (adults, long term unemployed women, women, women from the ethnical communities, young etc.), although they are officially contained in the state strategy and program documents, there are no concrete mechanisms developed for their comprehensive coverage.

In the absence of mechanisms, essential criteria and/or encouraging measures in the selection processes and in a situation where the selection criteria for beneficiaries are reduced solely to economic efficiency and do not include gender dimension, it cannot be expected that the programs and the measures will fulfill the envisaged objectives in the government strategy documents (for example, increasing the employment rate of women up to 38% in 2010).

Therefore, we emphasize that the employment of women shouldn't be left to coincidence, rather put additional efforts for including women on the labor market.

The following steps are **(8)** Registration of a family business and employment; **(9)** Signing contracts for grants in the form of equipment; **(10)** Purchase of equipment/reproductive materials of self employed; **(11)** Participation of the contributions in a period of 3 months for every self employed person.

Candidates which will pass the selection procedure and register a family business, will lose the status of unemployed individual within a period of three years.

Every candidate at the start and/or registration of the business receives support in a maximum amount of 2500 EUR, for purchase of equipment/reproductive materials and participation in the payment of social security contributions from the salary, for the first 3 months after the self employment by the EARM.

(12) Evaluation

Within the Active Policy Program on employment there is a system for monitoring and record of the employment, through which it can be determined which beneficiaries of the measures returned in the records for unemployed after the specified period, and which have successfully continued with the realization of their business. However the data on registered business and crossed data of the owners of the business for the gender, ethnicity, region and sectors where the women are largely included and the men are not available at all times.

On the other hand, we did not come across to comprehensive research on the effects and the influence of the measures from the employment policies, during the

period of preparation of this report. The only relevant research in our opinion, regarding the findings and the content is the research conducted by the Agency for Promotion of Entrepreneurship⁴⁶ on 120 enterprises of 500 supported businesses in 2007.

In this research the gender dimension is not a subject of interest and apart from the data for 31% interviewed women, there are no additional gender – separated statistics from which we can receive information about the structure of those whose businesses succeeded on the labor market and those whose businesses failed; the gender division in the activities (production, trade, agriculture and services), region and ethnicity; the situation with the youth regarding gender and ethnicity and qualitative data for the problems which appear on the labor market.

The regional dimension mentioned in the Report, despite the fact that it's not accompanied by gender separated statistics is extremely important developmental dimension in creation of policies, in accordance with the profiles, the dominant occupations, the structure of the population, educational level etc.

The existence of comprehensive records of crossed data accompanied by analysis could be very important tool for identification and identification of the actions for the future In the active measures and employment policies.

The methodology of these and similar studies in the future should be without compromise gender sensitive and to have in mind the specifications of different categories of beneficiaries, gender, region, ethnicity, occupation, education etc.

BUDGET ANALYSIS

Table 14. The budget of the OP for ATE in 2007, 2008 and 209 and participation of the self employment program (without the Program for Support for employment of the Roma people and the self employment program with credits, which weren't part of the OP in 2008).

Budget	Year	Self Evaluation Program Budget	Resources for the Operating Plan (OP)	Participation in the Self Employment Program in the OP
Planned	2007	88,300,000.00	297,600,000.00	29.67%
Realized	2007	99,506,490.00	265,823,779.00	37.43%
Planned	2008	97,235,600.00	294,191,921.00	33.05%
Realized	2008	102,487,500.00	275,560,821.00	37.19%
Planned	2009	122,407,300.00	825,102,860.00	14.84%

From the data on the budget in 2007, 2008 and 2009, in Table 14, we can see the increase of the resources in absolute figures for all programs and measures, including the Self Evaluation Program. The reduced percentage of participation in the Self Evaluation Program for 2009 is due to the increased number of measures form the employment active policies and to different distribution of the recourses.

Table 15. Summary of the budget expenses for 2007 and 2008

Self-employment program	Budget	Number of beneficiaries	Costs per unit	Distribution of the budget by gender	
				Women	Men
2007	84,506,490.00	558	151,445.00	21,052,245.00	63,455,455.00
2008	102,487,500.00	529	193,738.20	39,522,589.00	62,964,910.00

⁴⁶ Analysis of the successful Self Employment Project in 2007 with a proposal of measures to improve APERM, March 2009.

Table 16. Summary of gender segregation for 2007 and 2008

Self-employment program	Number of units and beneficiaries	Number of women	Number of men	% of women	% of men
2007	558	139	419	25%	75%
2008	529	204	325	39 %	61%

The total amount given in the budget is average value per participant.

Table 15 shows the summary of the costs and the distribution of resources in 2007 and 2008 between men and women.

In the programs for 2007 the procedure for purchase of equipment, depending on the business plan and the financial construction, suggests different budget distribution per participant. We were unable to obtain such details. Therefore, Table 15 is an average value per beneficiary from the measure support of self employment.

In Table 16, *Summary of gender segregation*, it is evident the improvement of women inclusion as beneficiaries of the resources and increasing their percentage rate in the Self Employment Program.

The number of interested women beneficiaries is bigger than the opportunities offered by this measure, but the selection criteria of the candidates does not provide a larger scale.

Although the strategy documents aim at covering all beneficiaries from the ethnical communities, distribution of recourses based on this category of beneficiaries, it was impossible to perform that due to lack of easy accessible statistics.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

- ◆ For the creators of the policies it is important to understand that the issue of gender equality and mainstreaming of gender perspectives is not an issue solely of social justice, it is rather an issue of particular significance in dealing with poverty and unemployment and securing equal opportunities and quality of living for all.
- ◆ Therefore, it is necessary to develop an understanding about the connection between the gender, poverty and employment and it is also necessary to realize that the achievement of grater gender equality and address the persistent inequalities often means different things to men and women, to identify the obstacles that they face, but also the needs, priorities and opportunities.
- ◆ Active employment policies cover only the category of citizens, registered in the EARM in search for job. The inactive population is not included in these policies, whose percentage is composed mostly of women. Gender equality is a fundamental principle in the European Employment Strategy, whose main postulate is to attract as many people in the labor market and to improve the position of groups and individuals, especially those on the margins of the labor market. That is why one of the fundamental aspects of the inclusion of gender issues in employment policies is that they are not restrictive, but are open to all citizens, including the inactive ones.
- ◆ We point to the necessity of opening the active employment policy and towards the inactive citizens and the introduction of activities to encourage the inclusion of the inactive population, especially women in the labor market.

- ◆ The inclusion of gender perspectives in the mainstream as a strategy by itself does not exclude the policies, programs or measures exclusively directed toward women. The existence of a target group of women, must not exclude their participation in the rest of the categories of target groups.
- ◆ We recommend to be taken into consideration the established practice within more European countries to apply the dual approach: target group women and women are represented by at least 40% in the rest of the categories of target groups. In this way the distribution of the budget regarding the final beneficiaries will be far more equal compared with the current.
- ◆ The institutions in the future must develop methodologies which will be useful for the objectives and for the target groups we want to realize.
- ◆ We recommend to evaluate the methodology about selection criteria for candidate's evaluation, according to the objectives in the strategy documents and to find ways to introduce the Provisional measures and other mechanisms that will enable easier access to target groups to the measure.
Strengthening is necessary, training and sensitiveness of all concerned parties and institutions involved in the implementation of employment policies, commissions, trainers, etc. The training should include issues of diversity, equal opportunities, equal access to different categories of beneficiaries and evaluation of the benefits of beneficiaries.
- ◆ Active employment policies should be accompanied by a comprehensive strategy for information, which will take into account the different categories of beneficiaries (youth, women, long-term unemployed, etc.). The forms and methods of information and encouragement should be adjusted according to target groups, regional, ethnic and gender specifications. This is especially important if we want to tackle the inactive part of the population.
- ◆ Active employment policies should be accompanied by campaigns for raising awareness about the power of entrepreneurship, creating a vision for a better life and better quality. Of course, these campaigns should be tailored to different categories of users, and gender concepts and the concepts of diversity to become integrated part in their planning, implementation and monitoring.
- ◆ Multiple and more common support in developing businesses through a variety of learning content (the leadership and entrepreneurship, marketing and accounting), advice and mentoring, not only in the process of starting a business, but in further stages of development, can help in strengthening the confidence of beneficiaries and potential users to persist on the labor market.
- ◆ Forming networks and support groups should be one of the ways to encourage and support those who started the business, but also for those who have not yet been decided to take this step. This approach is especially important for women which, often, because of the traditional role and economic weakness are not encouraged to face the challenges of modern times.
- ◆ All policies and strategy documents of the institutions, reports and analysis and in particular those relating to active employment policies should include gender-separated statistics and crossed data on ethnicity, residence, age and education, including gender-analytical information that explain the statistical differences. Divided in this way and crossed, the statistics should be a routine in every government analysis. They are extremely important in the processes of planning, and monitoring and evaluation of implemented policies and programs. The regional

and local approach are extremely important in this context.

- ◆ It is necessary to establish mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation of effects and impact of employment policies, strategies and programs that are not allowed to be gender-neutral and will take into account gender-separated statistics and crossed data on ethnic origin, place of residence, age, education, etc..
- ◆ Additionally, in circumstances where the greatest potential of the Macedonian state policy is directed towards economic reform and sealing with poverty, is it necessary to consider other alternative ways which will stimulate initiatives in the field of entrepreneurship and will encourage men and women to engage more actively on the labor market.
- ◆ Strategies for support and encourage civil society organizations, initiatives and/or groups whose primary mission is reducing poverty, analysis of the labor market, training and information in the field of entrepreneurship and related topics, can significantly contribute to the development of the society as a whole . Civil Society Organizations sometimes very successfully identify problems and are closer to people, rather than the state institutions. The support of women groups in this sense is also, extremely important.
- ◆ Self Employment Programs are funded with government money and therefore it is necessary that all end users have equal benefit.
- ◆ Therefore, we recommend that when the Government designs and implements financial incentive packages, to identify the difficulties women face with different social, ethnic, age, regional and other details of the race on the labor market and to apply the dual approach: 1) specific development policies for women as a target group (female entrepreneurship, training programs for women, loans for women as a target group, etc.) and 2) inclusion of gender issues in all policies, programs, strategies and development plans.

Frame No. 1. Review of experiences⁴⁷ of EU countries in the process of implementing gender issues in national programs through reform based on the European Employment Strategy.

In its own Self Employment Program, **Spain** is introducing support for the unemployed to start their business to the amount of 3000 - 5000 EUR. In the case of unemployed women, this rate reaches up to 7000 EUR.

Greece is introducing a system of encouragement and support of entrepreneurship for young graduate staff. This system covers a quota for women's participation up to 60%.

Italy is introducing a series of fiscal measures to support entrepreneurship by reducing taxes for business and the introduction of special measures and also lower taxes for those employers who will provide a contract for employment of women. This particularly applies to those regions in Italy where unemployment for women is 100% higher than the average rate in the European Union.

Luxembourg is introducing a voucher system for access to facilities for children care to those families who are at risk of poverty. In this way, they are trying to promote employment among women.

Slovakia is introducing work from home in order to provide greater flexibility for those with family responsibilities

Germany is establishing an Agency for Female Entrepreneurship funded by the Federal Government of Germany with the credit program of small businesses run by women.

Most of the EU countries made efforts to ensure the flexicurity during work, arising from the possibilities of making arrangements with flexible working hours and the expense of ensuring a system of social protection or security.

Explanation: Flexicurity appears as a term in use during the Portuguese EU Presidency in the discussions to improve social dialogue and reform the strategies for employment. The grounds for introducing flexicurity are the modern laws for work, a modern system of social protection and lifelong learning.

5.2. FORMALIZATION OF EXISTING BUSINESSES

Name of the program

Formalization of existent businesses. Starts in 2008 and continues in 2009

Institution in charged for implementation of the project

Ministry of Labor and Social Policy (MLSP), Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (EARM), the Central Registry (CR), Agency for Entrepreneurship Promotion of the Republic of Macedonia (AEPRM), the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) and USAID, in charge for Implementation of the program with OP for 2009.

⁴⁷ National Reform Programmes 2008 and 2009 and gender aspects of the European Employment Strategy, European Commission, Report, March 2009.

Objectives (explicit and implicit)

The objective of the program is to formalize businesses started by unemployed people and their legal participation on the labor market in the function of reducing the gray economy. The program is implemented through assistance for registration of existing business entities that informally have experience in performing the activity and who need a subsidy for formalization of the business.

Short description of the program

The program, formalization of existing businesses has a function of reducing the grey economy and is implemented with the help from people who informally have experience in conducting activities and who need a subsidy for the formalization of business⁴⁸. The support includes the costs for co-registration of the company in the amount of 3000.00 MKD; non refundable grants for procurement of equipment, reproductive materials and other resources necessary for business in the amount of 153,000.00 MKD, participation for social security contributions of the lowest base of the net salary in a certain activity in the amount of 13,500.00 MKD for the first three months. This program gives support to the unemployed registered persons who cannot return in the records of EARM within three years after the formalization.⁴⁹

Target groups

Entities that perform informal activities and those who are unemployed over a year.

Activities and measures

The measure will be implemented through assistance in the registration of existing business entities that have informal experience in performing the activity and who need a subsidy for formalization of the business.

GENDER BUDGET ANALYSIS:

Process analysis

Activities and operating guidelines for the Program for the formalization of an existing business are implemented in 2 phases and 8 steps.⁵⁰

The first phase covers the activities of the first 4 steps where the Self Employment Program is covered (1) Preparation of operating guidelines, in the form of Operating Guidelines document developed by the Technical Group and accepted by the NOP;⁵¹(2) a public announcement (3) registration and selection of candidates who applied under the established criteria for belonging to the target group, where having regard to ethnicity and the relationship of the unemployed in the municipality by the total population. Registration is done in the employment centers, and selection is made by the Central Registry (CR) ⁵² (4) The selection of the best business plans are made by experts from selected banks (independent commission) that rank the best plans for the prescribed number of members of the appropriate target group.

Therefore, the second stage from the project activities for formalization begins.

48 The Social Situation in Macedonia, MLSP, Skopje, 2008.

49 Operating Plan for active programs and employment measures for 2008, MLSP, Skopje, January 2008.

50 EARM, APERM, UNDP, Self Employment 2 and Technical Assistance to support the operating plan of the Government in 2008 for active measures on the labor market "march, 2008, pg.25.

51 Operating instructions refer to two measures: Self Employment (family business) and formalization of existing business. In the Report the two measures are considered under Item 3, as 3.A-self employment, and 3.B - formalization.

52 The completed and signed application form remains in the competent Employment center and is a valid document for further ranking of the candidates. The list of selected candidates is checked in the Central Registry. If it is established that the candidate has a registered firm he shall not be considered for further inclusion in the project.

(5) Support for establishment and formalization of businesses from the informal sector for those with the best business plans, UNDP Central Registry and EARM which are thus employed (M1-M2).⁵³

(6) Signing of Agreement (7) Provision of initial grants (non refundable grants) for the procurement of equipment and materials for starting a formal business. The procedures for the procurement of grants amounting to 2 500 EUR, up to 153 000 MKD are established. The procedures are precisely defined in the description of the action, participants, responsibilities and timetable for the procurement of up to \$ 2500 and for procurement above \$ 2500.⁵⁴

(8) The last step of the implementation of the measure for formalization is the participation, which consists in covering the costs of social insurance contributions by the EARM to a salary for a period of 3 months in the amount of 13,500.00 MKD.

The brief history of this program indicates that it actually comes from the Self Employment Program in 2007.

Specifically, when reviewing applications and assessing eligibility of applicants we have come to a conclusion that some of them already have their own businesses who are in the realm of the gray economy because they were rejected by the Self Employment Program. In the following year it was established a Program for Formalization of existing businesses, where they offer almost the same conditions as the self employment, except the paid services on preparing the business plans (voucher), because they already have their own experience and prepare their own plans. The other conditions are the same.

⁵⁵In the program for 2008 and 2009. the gender issues are not indicated, although it is envisioned and recommended with the national acts.⁵⁶ The target group of the Program for Formalization of the existing businesses is defined only on the basis of unemployment and the knowledge of the existence of experience in the informal business. According to the general provisions of the program, there is no emphasis on the gender issues. However, the result indicates a relatively high interest and ability of women to manage their own business, because a third of formalized business, are not for understatement.

And in the Program of Formalization, as well s in the Self Evaluation Program, the information for gender are not available for the entire process of registration in all selections (although information on gender exists in the first application). However, based on final data search of the data for formalization of businesses by gender, the

53 The Central Registry is in the procedure for exemption of the costs of registering the company for self-employed people under this project. MLSA provides conditions for the initiated action to be implemented completely, as provided in the budget of the project document, and EARM will help the unemployed to register as employed, providing M1-M2 form, source as in footnote pg. 4.

54 EARM, APP and UNDP: "Self Employment 2 and Technical Assistance to support the operating plan of the government in 2008 for active measures on the labor market, Operating Guidelines, March 2008.

55 With reference to the activities of the self employment program, the conditions and differences are not clearly specified in the program, support for formalizing the existing businesses and self employment, although the two programs actually are about self employment, but on a different grounds. Also, they are not specifically referred to either the OP for 2008 where under the heading 2.Program to support existing businesses write only "activities of the program 1 apply to this program, except the activity 4.1 and 5.1," MLSA: Operating Plan for active programs and employment measures in 2008, Skopje, in January 2008 year., Annex 1, pg. 23, while in OA for 2009. reads: the activities of the program 1 apply to this program, except the activity 4.1, and 5.1 and is amended to read, drawing-filling in the form of a mini business plan which is referred to the overall business in all its phases with the necessary indicators. MLSA: Operating Plan for active programs and measures for employment in 2009, Skopje, January 2009.

56 National Action Plan for Gender Equality 2006-2012 suggests that unlike the approach to equal opportunities term is extended to the fairness of the results allowed not only by equal treatment, but by equal access and equal benefits. The same is predicted by the strategic objective of active employment policies MLSA: Operational Plan for active programs and measures for employment in 2009, Skopje, in January 2009 year, pg. 34. MLSA: Operating Plan for active programs and measures for employment in 2009, Skopje, January 2009.

analysis shows that men are represented by 69% versus 31% of the total 107 women planned and implemented in the formalization for 2008.

Due to great interest for the program ensures were taken for transferring funds to an additional six formalizations, so that after the amendment, the number of formalizations increase to 113 totals. The ratio changed to 32.7% women and 67.3% men with an additional 6 selected formalized businesses. There are no data of the ethnicity for these businesses. Due to lack of data we cannot prepare a combined analysis of gender and ethnicity not to the registered, nor the selected candidates, which would be of great importance as from the gender, also from ethnic aspects.

Perhaps here, as in self-employment should emphasize the fact that the measuring instruments for personal, psychological and economic background, as well as entrepreneurial ability, in the questionnaire for self evaluation of the entrepreneurial aspirations, are not adapted to women and do not contain certain encouraging elements for their inclusion. Especially it concerns the attitudes and issues of economic nature (for monetary participation, employment of others, for their own safety in the transaction, etc.) in terms of inequality of women exactly in this area, as well as its traditional role in family and society.

Although in the policies are listed activities for monitoring the implementation of active measures, they cannot establish adequate responses for satisfaction and sustainability of the programs, except the control made within the implementation of the program which concluded that all 113 businesses formalized in 2008 function under the conditions under which they are formalized. Indirectly it indicates the degree of satisfaction and success of the business, but the period is too short to confirm the indicator. There must be at least little research or focus group method in order to gain insight into the situation. From the discussion with the individuals in charged for implementation, we can conclude that the project was successful.

BUDGET ANALYSIS

Table 17: The OP Budget for AEP in 2008 and 2009 and the participation of the Program for Formalization of the existent business (without the support program for employment of Roma and the Program for self-employment by crediting, which were not part of the Operational Program in 2008).

Budget	Year	Budget for the Formalization Program in 2008	Budget for OP for AEP for 2008	Participation of the Formalization program in the total budget for OP of AEP
Planned	2008	18,136,500.00	294,191,921.00	6.16 %
Implemented	2008	19,153,500.00	275,560,821.00	6.95 %
Planned	2009	47,000,000.00	825,102,860.00	5.69 %
Implemented	2009	-	-	-

The data for the budget in 2008 and 2009 show the increase in funds for all programs and measures. During the implementation of the Formalization program for the current business in 2008, the funds from other programs were relocated (parentless children and single parents) which contributed to the increase of the realized funds as compared to the projected funds. This is good from the aspect of employment, however not from the aspect of the implementation of certain programs. The successfulness in the reduction of the share in shadow economy is obvious through the Formalization Program, due to which the funds should be doubled. During the program analysis, we have reviewed the data for 2008 and 2009, because the Formalization Program started in 2008 and having in mind the projected funds, which is what actually happened. In 2009, as an absolute amount, as well as relatively, the share in the Operational program

was reduced.0 The reason for this is probably due to the introduction of new programs, and the success of the implemented program is undisputable. Having in consideration the basic objective in 2008, it was maximally successful (Table No. 17.)

Table 18. Allocated beneficiary of the Program for 2008 according to gender.

Type of measure	no. of beneficiaries	No. of women	No. of men	% women	% men
Formalization	113	35	78	33 %	67%

Gender equality has been integrated in the use of the funds, in context that each person, regardless of its gender, receives equal funds. However, having in mind the amount of the assets, the female share in the program is 1/3, thus they use 1/3 of the means.

It must be pointed out here that the start of use of the means for formalization (and self-employment) is an amount of 2500 EUR, due to which, the data clearly show that the average is identical for men and women, thus it is given individually. The Gender aspect is blurred.

Table 19. Gender responsive budget for the Support program for the formalization of the existent businesses.

Type of measure	Budget (in MKD)	no. of beneficiaries	Expenses per unit	Distribution of the budget according to gender	
				Women	Men
Formalization	19,153,500.00	113	169,500	5,932,500.00	13,221,000.00

Accordingly, the estimates for the expenses for women and men, as a multiplication of the number of beneficiaries per unit expense is equal, and differences cannot be determined, if any, except from the total amount, because men have a share of 2/3, thus 2/3 of the total means are accounted for that part (Table 19)

The inspection and sustainability of the start-ups has been completed in a very short period of time upon their establishment, and it has been concluded that they operate according to the registered activity.

In context of the ethnic origins, the situation shows that there was not enough activities related to the promotion of the program from gender, ethnic and regional aspect. Due to this, it must be concluded that the access to this program should be improved, in direction to information, promotion and popularizing of the program, because this is also presented by the fact that in 2008, from registered 384 (the first step) only 120 have a follow-up procedure, because only they complied with the selection conditions and criteria.

Table 20. Budget for the Formalization Program for the existent businesses according to ethnic origin

Ethnic origin	no. of beneficiaries	Budget distribution according to ethnic origin
Macedonians	101	17,119,500.00
Albanians	4	678,000.00
Serbs	1	169,500.00
Unknown	7	1,186,500.00
Total	113	19,153,500.00

The beneficiaries of the services and means according to the above data are total of 113, 78 male and 35 female beneficiaries. According to their age and rural

– urban environment, there are no data, and according to the ethnic origins of the beneficiaries, 101 are Macedonians, 4 Albanians, 1 Serb, and there are no data for the ethnic origin and gender.

The total number of registered applicants is 384 and the data have been distributed according to gender.

Data according to gender have been obtained based on the reports by the implementers and the reviews of the conditions with the active measures for employment, which sometimes coincide.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS⁵⁷

- ◆ The analysis of the active measure formalization of the existent business within the frames of the governmental active policies for reduction of unemployment started its implementation in 2008, and thus it is difficult to determine its efficiency and sustainability. Still, data from the short period so far show that it justifies the basic objective, the increase of the number of employees and the reduction of the share of shadow economy on the labor market. An indicator for this is the interest of unemployed persons and their participation in the realization of the measure, which surpasses the determined number, which on the other hand indicates the wish of the population to legalize their jobs and working status, if there is minimum social efforts and assistance.
- ◆ Still according to the analysis of this program, we cannot speak of gender sensitivity in relation to this measure. There is no gender approach here and it is left to the circumstances, and it is not even planned in the design of the introduction of the measure, which results in lack of the possibility to distribute beneficiaries according to gender, without additional processing of the materials, which often is not possible.
- ◆ The share of women and men in the unpaid labor and shadow economy is great and does not contribute to the economic growth and development of the country.
- ◆ Because of this, we recommend finding out mechanisms for possibilities for greater involvement, especially of women, in the work force, and also increase the rate of activities thereof.
- ◆ It is recommended to take in consideration the specific activities, characteristic for different regions of the country, i.e. take in consideration the regional natural and human resources in the programs for formalization and self-employment.
- ◆ It is also recommended that the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy establish its own data base for all areas, in this case for AEP and social protection for the possibility of gender and other analyses.
- ◆ It is recommended that all implementers of programs comply with the concept of gender equality, at least in the parts where it is legally regulated, and gender fragmentation of data, based on gender, ethnic origin, place of residence, age, etc, compliance therewith until the end of the selection processes.
- ◆ There is an evident need of further researches to monitor the sustainability of the formalized businesses, and special studies of the causes that enable, i.e., impede the sustainability of the business for a longer period of time, or for finding a lasting solution for the unemployment.

⁵⁷ The greatest part of the conclusions and recommendations of the self-employment and formalization measures overlap. Because of this it is necessary to have integral monitoring. In this part we just point out the most significant.

5.3. PROGRAMME FOR SUBSIDIZED EMPLOYMENT

Title of the program

Subsidized employment 2007, 2008 and 2009.

Institution implementing the project

The Ministry for Labor and Social Policy (MoLSP), the Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (EARM), Centers for social issues (CSI).

Goals (explicit and implicit Goals)

The Program also contains measures in the field of social protection, in order to create an efficient social protection system and productive engagement of the socially vulnerable groups, in order to reduce poverty and introduce them on the labor market and in normal life.

Short description

The Government Program 2006-2012, with its active measures, covers vulnerable social categories.⁵⁸ Such measure is the prescribed subsidized employment, which started in 2007 and continued in 2008 and 2009, with certain changes and amendments. In 2007, this Program was implemented through 3 measures which prescribe subsidies for employment unemployed persons from the vulnerable categories (persons with disabilities, single parents, and orphans). In 2008, the Program for subsidies broadened with the group for employment older people (from 55-64 years of age), and the four measures continue in 2009 with greater funds.

Target group

Registered unemployed persons with status orphans, after they leave the institutions for social care; disabled persons in accordance with the Law on employment of disabled persons; single parents; registered unemployed persons from the age of 55 to 64 (from 2008 and 2009) and young people up to the age of 27 and unemployed persons with terminated employment, based on bankruptcy of enterprises dominantly owned by the State, with share of over 50%. Subsidized employment of this group started from 2008.

Activities and Measures:

The employment agency announced new public calls to the employers for employment of the vulnerable groups. Subsidies for the disabled persons have been prescribed in the Operational program for the active policies for 2007, and from thereon it shall be the current activity of the Employment Agency.

Subsidizing employment of disabled persons is conducted according to the Law on Employment of disabled persons, in the amount of 20 to 30 average salaries for employment for each disabled person by the company and other type of financial assistance as prescribed with the Law.

In 2007, for the purpose of support for employment of 500 single parents and 100 orphan children, there is an annual projection for subsidizing employment by providing financial aid from the State, in the amount of 11,200 MKD per month (salary and contributions, food and transportation allowances, however, not more than 11,200 MKD per month) for the period of 6 months, whereas, the employer shall be obliged to keep these persons on the work post at least for another 18 months.

⁵⁸ *The Social Image of RM, MLSP, 2008.*

The scope and conditions changed in 2008. Subsidies have been prescribed for 50 orphan children through the financial assistance for salaries, salary allowances, food and transportation, in the amount of 15,000 MKD per month, for a period of 9 months, with obligation on the part of the employer to keep them on the work post for another 18 months, which means a total of 27 months.

For support of employment of 200 single parents, a financial assistance is projected for the employers, in the amount of 12,000 per month, for salaries and salary allowances, food and transportation for one person for a period of 6 months.

For support of employment of 150 unemployed older persons, a financial assistance is projected for the employers, to the amount of 12,000 per month, for salaries and salary allowances, food and transportation for one person for a period of 9 months.

Subsidizing employment for young people up to 27 years of age, and unemployed persons with terminated employment due to bankruptcy in enterprises predominantly owned by the State, with share of over 50%.

This measure also prescribes provision of financial assistance for health insurance fees for the employers who shall employ registered unemployed persons up to 27 years of age, and unemployed persons with terminated employment based on bankruptcy in enterprises predominantly owned by the State, with share of over 50%, and that is for the first 18 months of employment. The employer shall be obliged to keep employed the persons which shall be employed with this type of financial assistance for at least another 2 years. The monthly fee per person is prescribed to be 2,234 MKD, i.e. 11,170,000.00 MKD for 5000 persons.

GENDER ANALYSIS OF THE PROCESS AND BUDGET

Implementation process and coordination among institutions

The Program for subsidized employment of the socially vulnerable categories contains a special situation of interactions among institutions of the State, which are the implementers of the program, from the one hand, and on the other hand, the employers and beneficiaries. The problem is in defining the target groups, because, with the measures of the subsidizing policy the action is conducted through the subsidizing measures, which apply to the needs of the employers, and the effect on the end users is indirect. Employers are the mediators for a certain period of time, while the payment for the period is made by the Employment Agency. Thus, the activities and the promotion should be directed to employers as a mediation tool between the provider of the subsidy and the final beneficiary. The motif of the employer is to receive adequate quality of the work and long term solution for the need to fill in the vacant work post. If we manage to promote the program and the measures with greater number of employers, the implementation shall be successful also for the indirect beneficiaries, in this case, defined as socially vulnerable target groups. The announcements for the working posts this time was directed to the employers and vulnerable groups, for which data are provided from the social issues centers for the employment centers, which are used by the employers to select adequate candidates for their needs.

Several institutions participate in their recruitment for the employment program: The Employment Agency, the Social issues centers, and the Ministry for Labor and Social policy. The Employment Agency shall undertake all regular activities for subsidizing employment of disabled persons (from 2008 categorized as handicapped persons) in

accordance with the Law on Employment for disabled persons.

The Ministry of Labor and Social Policy (the Sector for social protection) requires data regarding orphan children and single parents from the centers for social affairs. They are competent for provision of data for single parents, as follows: According to number, qualifications, location (place, city, etc, where they may be employed), number of children, age group and other relevant data, as well as data for orphan children according to number, qualification, skills, location (place, city, etc, where they can be employed) and other relevant data. Data are delivered to the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy.

According to the lists and data delivered from the CSI, the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy (the Sector for social protection) prepares an integrated rank list of single parents and integrated list of orphan children and delivers the same to the Employment Agency.

Based on the list of single parents (unemployed), the Employment Agency publishes an announcement to invite the interested employers to employ single parents, in accordance with the conditions, as prescribed by this measure and the employer choose the candidates according to their needs.

In accordance with the announcement, the Employment Agency shall conclude an agreement for employment of persons for a period of six months, with the interested employers who have applied and this agreement shall determine the rights and obligations of the contractual parties and the conditions and the manner of financial assistance for employment of single parents.

The employment agency shall conduct a monthly payment for the employed single parents, through this measure, upon previous report on the performed work delivered by the employers, where these persons are employed.

If necessary, the Employment Agency shall provide additional courses and trainings for orphan children and also trainings for the single parents covered by this measure.

Effectiveness of the Program Implementation

Data regarding implementation of the Program are modest and the main information are obtained from the report on the realization of the active policies – measures for employment from the Operational plan for the active policies for employment for 2007, prescribed by the Program for operation of the Government of the Republic of Macedonia for 2006- 2010 (as of 31.12.2007) and the Information for implementation of active programs and measures for employment for the year 2008 and guidelines for preparation of the Operational plan for active programs and measures for employment for 2009, prepared by the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy and the Employment Agency.

They are indicators that the sole measure, actually unsuccessful, especially with orphan children and single parents, due to the small number of employments in 2007. For example, after the first and the second public call to the employers, only a small number of employments have been realized. 69 of the planned 500 single parents and 3 of the planned 100 orphan children, i.e. only 12% of the planned 600 in 2007 have used the subsidized employment. Thus, it is considered that the planned number of 500 single parents and 100 orphan children is not actually feasible.

The reasons for this are the following: Unattractiveness of the target ggroup for

the employers, because they have low level of education, the qualification structure, low social status, mothers of small children, etc.⁵⁹ There is also an opinion that the planned number of 600 (500 single parents and 100 orphan children) of total number of 2500 registered in the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy is too ambitious on one hand, and on the other hand, the experiences show that the private sector rarely accepts these target groups.

That is why, the challenge shall be to encourage the private sector to employ these target groups, by a bigger monthly amount which shall be provided by the State for the purpose of employment of these persons, as it is prescribed in the operational plan for 2009⁶⁰.

The amount of the subsidy per person according to the information in the Employment Agency is also not enough to attract employers.

In 2008, upon completion of the public calls, the condition with the employment in separate groups is given in the following review:⁶¹

Subsidizing employment of orphan children:

- 4 employment contracts have been concluded.

Subsidizing employment of disabled persons:

- 112 or 56% of the planned 200, expecting to cover all until the end of the year.

Subsidizing employment of single parents:

- 80 or 48% of the planned 200.

Subsidizing employment of older persons (from 55 to 64 year of age):

- 142 contract have been concluded from the planned 150 or 95%, and

Subsidizing employment for young people up to 27 years of age, and unemployed persons with terminated employment due to bankruptcy in enterprises predominantly owned by the State, with share of over 50%. According to the information from the Health Insurance Fund, funds have been required only for 50 persons, for the purpose of health participation.⁶²

The gender issues are neither given in the Operational plan, nor in the program implementation, i.e. realization of the measures. In relation to the disabled persons, they are employed according to the conditions prescribed by a special law. From the registered unemployed disabled persons in the Employment Agency in 2007, 34,9% are women, and in 2008, 34, 1% are women.⁶³ The ratio is similar in the case of employment; however, apart from the severity of the disability, the gender dimension must also be taken in consideration in the social context of the disabled persons.

In case of single parents, what is significant from the gender aspect is actually the issue why women and men raising a child on their own do not accept the measure, i.e. the share of those that accept it is 48%, or they are not accepted by the employers.

59 Report on the realization of the active policies – measures for employment from the Operational plan for active policies of employment for 2007, as prescribed with the Program of operation of the Government of RM 2006-2010 (as of 31.12.2007).

60 Report on the realization of the active policies – measures for employment from the Operational plan for active policies of employment for 2007, as prescribed with the Program of operation of the Government of RM 2006-2010 (as of 31.12.2007).

61 Information on implementation of active programs and measures for employment for 2008 and directions for preparation of the Operational plan for active programs and measures for employment for 2009, prepared by the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy and the Employment agency.

62 Ibid. page.

63 Data estimated from the Review of unemployed disabled persons according to their age structure, as of 31.12.2007 and 31.12.2008 година.

An assumption, related to women single parents in our surrounding, regardless of the case, is that a single mother, regardless of the reasons (child outside marriage, widow, divorced woman) is exposed to the effect of certain stereotypes in the living and working environment, while the second assumption, related to all, is the fact that there is a special connection between income from social aid and the income from employment, i.e. it is an assessment of the cost effectiveness of the employment as compared to the social aid, because it carries additional expenses for the parents (organization for nursing the children, traveling expenses from and to work, etc.). It is of social importance to pay attention and take in consideration the wide range of circumstances when we speak about active policies for these groups, especially in the case of single parents and older people, where the gender responsive budgeting is the result of biological, i.e. demographic regularities.

Furthermore, it may be concluded that the employers are not interested to employ single parents because they doubt their efficiency, such as for example: absences from work due to illness of the child, incapability for overtime work, etc. Maybe this measure should also cover other types of support, such as lower costs for nursing the children or other privileges for children, so that single parents would be additionally facilitated to actively search for job, and not only remain on the passive support they receive by the State, i.e. use of social aid, because it is the cheapest, but, at the same time, the most expensive for the country, because it is an expense from the financial standpoint. From a social standpoint, it means incapability for social inclusion of the vulnerable groups.

In context of gender, it can be concluded that at the start of the implementation of the measures for subsidizing and during recruitment of the target groups, done through the Centers for social affairs, and the lists are prepared in the Ministry for Labor and Social Policy, the gender responsiveness is not taken in consideration as a factor in any of the steps of the selection or any further offer of the available work force to employers, and they do not enjoy any advantage, in the case of employment of women. The market values are strictly taken in consideration, thus the employers, in their selection for employment for their needs, maintain the market criteria. This may only mean that the gender does not have any effect, neither in the encouragement, not in recruitment, nor in ranking during the selection, and the offer to the employers, and the gender perspective is not promoted in the Program for subsidized employment.

Therefore, there is a recommendation that efforts must be put in the implementation of each step of every action related to integration of the gender perspective, in this case, in the active policies for employment, to find out mechanisms for gender approach and promotion of the gender perspective, especially those at the institutional level.

BUDGET ANALYSIS

Before starting with the budget analysis, due attention is necessary for the discrepancy in presenting data, due to the lack of certain data in both analyzed years, in all target categories. Thus, for 2007, the data are not given in a table, for 2008 there is no gender responsive data for the category of disabled persons, and accordingly, there is no data according to gender for the total measure of subsidizing. The tables mark the inavailability of data, however, where possible, the analysis includes the gender aspect.

Table No. 21 shows gender distribution of the employed persons according to the categorization of the target groups from the Program for subsidized employment

and gender responsive budget, where possible. Once again, it must be emphasized that objections are allowed regarding the presented situation, having in mind the lack of consistent data from the sources, however, the situation is not significantly changed from the gender aspect. The table shows great share of men in employment in all groups, except single parents, as it was expected. According to the data for the households from the Census in 2002, there is four times greater number of households of mother with a child, as compared to households of a father with a child, which clarifies the probability for distribution of vacant work posts. The condition in the case of disaled persons is proportional the existent ratio, although it is norable to take in consideration the circumstances related to the condition of women in the family, and the broader living environment.

Table 21. Gender responsive employment and budget in the planned and realized costs for employments in the Program for subsidized employment for 2008, expressed in MKD and per person.

Type of measure	Planned employments	Realized employments					Spent means In MKD
		Total	Male No:	Female No:	Male %	Female %	
Subsidized employment of:	600	338	-	-	-	-	94,436,000.00 For 1 person: 279,396.50
Orphan children	50	4	3	1	75.0	25.0	540,000.00 For 1 person: 135,000.00
Disabled persons	200	112	-	-	-	-	72,800.000 For 1 person: 650,000.00
Single parents	200	80	15	65	18.8	81.2	5,760,000.00 For 1 person: 72,000.00
Older persons (55-64 years of age)	150	142	74	68	52.1	47.9	15,336,000.00 For 1 person: 108,000.00

Table 22. Gender responsive budget for the program for subsidizing employment for 2007 and 2008.

Type of measure	Year	Budget (in MKD)	no. of beneficiaries	Expenses per unit	Distribution of the budget according to gender Women Men
Subsidized employment of:	2007	76,338,400.00	348	219,363.00	- -
	2008	94,436,000.00	338	279,396.50	- -
Single parents	2007	4,636,800.00	69	67,200.00	-
	2008	5,760,000.00	80	72,000.00	80,640,000.00 men 616,118.33 women
Orphan children	2007	201,600.00	3	67,200.00	-
	2008	540,000.00	4	135,000.00	405,000.00 men 135,000.00 women
Disabled persons	2007	71,500,000.00	276	259,058.00	-
	2008	72,000,800.00	112	650,000.00	-
Older persons (55-64 years of age)	2007	-	-	-	-
	2008	15,336,000.00	142	108,000.00	9,612,000.00 men 5,724,000.00 women

Note: The mark “ - ” in some fields of the table means that data is not available, and the mark in the whole row means that the measure ws not prescribed for the relevant year.

Source: Review of planned employments – engagements and planned and spent means within active programs for employment of the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy (28.7.2009)

In the process of employment for 2007, for the first time an active measure for employment was introduced, which was exclusively intended for the vulnerable groups of unemployed persons, which is very important, as reduction of their unemployment, and also for their social inclusion. Tables 21 and 22 and 23 present absolute and relative indicators for the planned and spent means, as well as for the planned and realized employments. Indicators present that in 2007 the means for the Operational program have been used by 89.3%, which is due to different realization of the means according to different measures. The means for the disabled persons have been used in accordance with the plan, although the number of employments is 33,5% over the planned employments. Regarding the other two target groups, the realization of the program is minimal with 3% and 13,8% of the planned. (Table 21)

Table 23. Planned funds and number of employments and share of spent means and realized employments in the planned according to the measures in the Program for subsidizing in 2007 and 2008.

Type of the program and employment measures	Planned employments - engagements		Planned means		Realized employments - engagements		Spent means	
	Year	No:	Amount - day	%	No:	%	Amount per day	%
Subsidizing single parents, disabled persons and orphan children								
Single parents	2007 2008	500 200	33,600,000.00 14,400,000.00	100 100	69 80	14 40	4,636,800.00 5,760,000.00	14 40
Orphan children	2007 2008	100 50	6,700,000.00 6,750,000.00	100 100	3 4	3 8	201,600.00 540,000.00	3 8
Disabled persons	2007 2008	200 200	71,500,000.00 72,800,000.00	100 100	276 112	138 56	71,500,000.00 72,800,000.00	100 100
Older persons (55 - 64 years)	2007 2008	- 150	- 16,200,000.00	- 100	- 142	- 95	- 15,336,000.00	- 95
Total for subsidies	2007 2008	800 600	111,800,000.00 110,150,000.00	100 100	348 338	44 56	76,338,400.00 94,436,000.00	68 86
Total for Operational plan	2007 2008	8400 7165	297,600,000.00 294,191,921.00	100 100	7889 6822	94 95	265,823,779.00 275,560,821.00	89 94

Source: The Ministry of Labor and Social Policy, Review of the situation with the active measures of employment, the budget for 2007 and the realized results and Review of the planned employments and engagements and planned spent means with active employment programs, OP 2008, and OP 2009, the Ministry, 28.07.2009, with the following notification: The Program for employment of Roma, in 2008 was not part of the Operational plan. The same applies to the table for 2007.

According to an employed person in 2007, the following are the costs: 67,200 MKD per beneficiary in the case of single parents, 67,200 MKD per beneficiary in the case of orphan children, and 267,790 MKD per beneficiary, in the case of disabled persons.

In 2008, the newly introduced measure for employment of older persons (55 to 64 years of age) was successfully realized, with 95%, while the measures for the single parents and orphan children mark greater realization (40% and 8%) as compared to the previous year, however, it is still far from the planned realization.. the measure for subsidizing disabled persons, according to the number of employments, did not reach the planned level, but it exceeded the means.

Thus, per beneficiary, the costs this year shall be as following: In the case of single parents 72,000 -12,000 MKD per month for the period of 6 months; in the case of orphan children - 135,000 -15,000 per month for a period of 9 months and in case of disabled persons 616,118 and in case of persons at the age of 55-64, the costs shall be 110,000-12,000 per month for a period of 9 months, per beneficiary. The total amount for the single parents is the lowest, having in mind the remaining categories, although they probably have the biggest expenses at entry on the labor market. This is due to the difference in the length of the provided subsidies to the salary of 12 000 MKD, which is only 6 months, as compared to the other categories, such as orphan children for example, which are subsidized with 15,000 MKD for 9 months and persons at the age of 55-64, with 12,000 MKD, also for a period of 9 months, the same is for the disabled persons. Maybe the difference between the amount and the time is the reason for the lower response and it is neither motivating for the employers, nor for single parents as final beneficiaries.

In 2008, the means for the subsidizing program were slightly increased, and also their usage with 95%, which indicates the sustainability and perspective of the program.

As regards to the budget means allocated to this program, it may be indicated the success rate of the program as a whole, if means are relocated within the target groups. It is correct that the measure for the disabled persons is the most successful, probably due to the longer operational experience of the same and the already established way of application. Similarly, the same conclusion goes for the group of persons at the age of 55-64. However, for the group of single parents and orphan children, greater network of cooperation should be established among all relevant institutions implementing the program: The Employment Agency, especially the centers for social affairs and the skillful involvement of employers as mediators to the end users. The creators of the policies must find a way for them to be motivated for accomplishing greater realization of active employment of unemployed persons.

The data from the Employment Agency that records the unemployed in 2007, 2008 and 2009, indicated that 80% thereof, that is 277360 average for the three years, who are active in search for a job (and 20% apply due to fulfillment of certain formal conditions for receipt of other type of benefits, such as health protection, for which the condition is the person to be recorded in the registry of unemployed).⁶⁴

RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

- ◆ The analysis of the programme for subsidizing socially endangered groups is of great importance for the solution of existential problems of people and their families, as well as their integration into the labour market.
- ◆ Therefore, special approaches and benefits for the employers are recommended. There should be more interest and commitments towards the employers, so as to provide better employment rate. In fact, they are the policy bearers and the state influences the improvement of the employment situation of persons with special needs and socially endangered people through them. It can be seen in 2009, when the changes of the 2009 OP attracted significantly greater interest of the employers.

⁶⁴ Review of unemployed persons recorded in the Employment agency of RM; recorded unemployed persons from 01.01.2007 to 31.12.2007, 01.01.2008 to 31.12.2008 and the end of April 2009.

- ◆ The inability to monitor all procedures and their implementation is a shortcoming.
- ◆ Therefore, it is recommended to record the situation for each of the undertaken measures in order to identify the obstacles during their implementation.
The meaning of the gender aspect and its involvement in all of the phases from policy making to their implementation and monitoring is recommended and emphasized, particularly concerning the vulnerable groups that could organize dignified everyday life if their existential issues were settled, and thus contributing to the society, and not being only a cost. So far it is known that the most vulnerable groups are women and children, and they have special legal protection, guaranteed by the Constitution.
- ◆ Efforts must be found in each step of any action concerning the gender mainstreaming, in this case, in the active employment policies to find gender approach mechanisms and promotion of the gender perspective, especially at the institutional level.
- ◆ Evaluation is recommended after the realization of the programme, in order to eliminate any future shortcomings, as well as a survey of the opinion of the end users and their experience regarding the introduction, presentation, participation and difficulties during the utilization of the programmes.
- ◆ An intensive cooperation among all relevant institutions implementing programmes concerning the vulnerable groups, single parents and children without parents is recommended, especially the centres for social work already working with them, as well as to provide maximum opportunity for target groups and advantage when using such programmes.
- ◆ In this context is the recommendation to equal the means, or conditions for all target groups, or to explain and elaborate the lower amount of the subsidy and time for certain groups, such as single parents
- ◆ The employers should be adequately approached in order to increase their interest, with a special emphasis on the gender perspective. It is recommended to consider alleviating circumstances concerning the employment of vulnerable groups and special motivation of the gender approach, for instance, gaining extra points, or advantage when selecting employers for subsidized employment if they employ women.

We strongly recommend more intensive cooperation among all relevant institutions implementing the programme: the employment service agency, especially centres for social work, and skillful involvement of the employers as a mediating link not only of economic, but of social interest, as well. Policy makers should find ways, with the assistance of the competent services, positive practices from countries with similar experience and other relevant sources of knowledge, to motivate themselves for greater realization of the active employment of the unemployed.

5.4. PROGRAMME FOR PREPARATIONS FOR EMPLOYMENT

Title of the Programme

Programme For Preparations For Employment (2007, 2008)

Institution Responsible for the Project Implementation

Employment Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (EARM)

Goals (explicit and implicit goals)

The goals of the programme for preparation for employment are targeted

towards the improvement of the competitiveness of the unemployed persons in the labour market, through training, retraining or additional training and counseling.

Brief Description

Training, retraining or additional training of the unemployed is delivered for well-known employer who needs persons with specific professions and qualifications.

The measures of this programme are realized through the following: training, retraining and additional training for well-known employer; trainings in employment clubs for acquiring knowledge and skills (foreign languages and computer skills); training pilot project for skills and abilities that are deficient in the labour market; education for starting own business.

Target Groups

Registered unemployed persons

Activities and Measures

The activities and measures to support this programme are described in detail in the operational plans for 2007, 2008 and 2009. Comprehensive procedure and the manners how the beneficiaries are involved within these measures are described, as well.

GENDER ANALYSIS OF PROCESSES AND BUDGETS

In most of research studies, including those conducted by the EARM, the labour market in the Republic of Macedonia is characterized as unprofessional and not competitive, and the structure of the registered unemployed persons, according to the level of education is characterized as not qualified or semi-qualified.

The most recent data from the graduation examinations in the Republic of Macedonia in 2009 pointed to a weak formal education system and the existence of extremely high disparities in relation to regions, suburban and urban areas.

The non-formal and adult education are still not entirely integrated within the education system of the Republic of Macedonia, nor in the people's mentality to the extent that provides fulfillment of the European standards. The Centre for Professional Education and Training (CPET), which should be one of the drivers in this sphere, is still not entirely functional. Although its role is to create programmes in accordance with the labour market needs, the connection between the Ministry, CPET and EARM concerning the training plans and programmes creation within the active employment policies part and wider, is almost imperceptible.

The last report of the European Commission⁶⁵ points out that there is a lack of plan for vocational education and qualification that would reflect the labour market conditions appropriately.

From the analysis of the documents and reports offering limited number of data, it can be concluded that the programmes for employment preparation consist of qualification and requalification training for known or unknown employer, skills training (language and computer skills) and pilot trainings for skills that are deficient in the labour market. All registered persons in the EARM are included in these trainings.

The trainings defined in such manner do not recognize gender inequalities and they do not provide manners how to motivate the inactive population to become involved

65 Progress Report of the RM.

in the labour market.

Retraining and additional training for known employer

Retraining and additional training for known employer are carried out through monthly participation in the employer's expenses in the amount of MKD 2000 and financial aid to the unemployed person in the amount of MKD 4000 for the period of up to three months, and the employer mustn't dismiss the trained person for the period of one year.

According to the EARM's data, 2543 persons are included in the programme, 1829, or 72% of which commenced employment relation for undetermined time, which should be welcomed.

Nevertheless, from the EARM's reports it cannot be concluded what type of trainings, retraining, or additional training they are, and they are not divided per activity, gender or profession, ethnical background or region.

We could not obtain any data regarding the number of persons who commenced employment relation in 2007 and are still working, or how many persons managed to survive in the labour market thanks to the training, retraining, or additional training.

Training in employment clubs for acquiring knowledge and skills (foreign languages and computer skills)

Trainings for acquiring English language and computer skills are realized under this programme.

Based on the response and the range of beneficiaries, we can conclude that there is an interest for these trainings.

It is worth mentioning that after the completion of the trainings 13.6% of persons who attended the trainings were employed, and 11.7% of them were women.

Pilot training for particular professions and skills which are deficient in the labour market

Training for 108 persons is provided under this measure for the following professions: electrician and electrical fitter, gas fitters and plumbers, maintenance mechanics, mechatronic systems, argon welders.

The total budget for the realization of these trainings is MKD 5,313,600.00 or EUR 86,681.00. Of these, MKD 2,952,000.00 were realised in 2008. This training programme does not include any woman.

The analysis of the labour market needs for 2007 and 2008 presents the trends and demand of labour force in the Republic of Macedonia, for certain activities, including a profile of deficient personnel, particularly for activities where the demand for labour force is the greatest – the processing industry.

Depending on the level of professional preparation and level of education, following professions are listed here: textile technicians, graphic technicians, wood technicians, fur tailors, shoe makers, builders, armature workers and welders, then tailors, wine workers, workers in the fruit and vegetable processing industry.⁶⁶

We could not obtain more detailed data why and on what grounds the professions

⁶⁶ National Report on the analysis of the skills demand in the labour market in the Republic of Macedonia for 2008, EARM, Skopje, June 2008.

proposed in the active employment policies measures were defined as deficient, and how the women were encouraged to become involved in the less represented activities (according to the programme documents).

BUDGET ANALYSIS

Due to lack of data, no tabular overview of the budget and expenses breakdown for 2007 can be provided, nor data can be given per gender.

The analysis of the budget and the utilization of the means for 2008 for training, retraining and additional training (Table no. 24) indicates that there are significant achievements in this segment, and the participation of women is considerable, almost 80% for training and retraining and languages and computer skills training.

No research has been carried out to discover what the reasons for such interest and the long-term effects of the application of these measures are.

Table 24. Overview of the Budget for 2008. Gender segregation

	No. of units and beneficiaries	Number of women	Number of men	% of women	% of men
Programme for preparations for employment					
1. Training, retraining or additional training of unemployed persons for known employer	2543	2020	523	79.43	20.57
Training in employment clubs For acquiring knowledge (foreign languages and computers) and skills	2278	1603	675	70.37	29.63
Pilot training for particular professions and skills which are deficient in the labour market	60	0	60	0	100

Source: EARM

Table 25. Overview of the Budget for 2008

	Budget	Number of beneficiaries	Costs per unit	Distribution of the Budget
Programme for preparations for employment				
1. Training, retraining or additional training of unemployed persons for known employer	45,774,000.00	2543	18,000.00	36,360,000.00 women 9,414,000.00 men
Training in employment clubs For acquiring knowledge (foreign languages and computers) and skills	1,900,000.00	2287	83000	1,337,006.15 women 562,993.85 men
Pilot training for particular professions and skills which are deficient in the labour market	2,952,000.00	60	49,20000	0 women 2,952,000.00 men

Source: EARM

On the other hand, the budget analysis indicates a situation where a significant part of the means (when the means are divided per unit/beneficiaries) intended for training of larger number of women is considerably lower in relation to other measures.

If compared, it can be concluded that when the value is lower, as in the case of training of MKD 860 per beneficiaries, the beneficiaries are predominantly women, and when the value per beneficiary is much higher, MKD 193,738.00 in the part of self-employment or business formalization, or in the part of local public works, MKD 20,516.00, and in the part of construction works and environmental projects, MKD 47,542.00 and training for deficient skills, the beneficiaries are predominantly men.

Retraining and additional training include considerably larger number of women where the costs per unit beneficiary are MKD 18,000.00. Nevertheless, we could not obtain any analytical information on how effectively the programmes for training, retraining and additional training are being realized and what the long-term effects of this measure are.

In the end, although we are not able to provide tabular review of the expenses per gender for all programmes and measures, due to lack of information, we still believe that, even if at the level of assumptions, it is worth indicating a few key conclusions of the budget analysis in the measures of the active employment policies and those which are not a direct subject of analysis.

The measure 1 of the active employment policies - Public Works, assistance for the local self-government units in 2007, provides for payment of means for hiring person on the total of 51 projects realized in the units of the local self-government. 965 short-term employment were realized under this measure, with a total realized budget of 19,797,915 MKD. This means that, in average, each hired person received MKD 20,516. We were not able to obtain other necessary information per gender to fully present a clear picture.

The active measure 3 in 2007 provides for engagement of unemployed persons from the least developed regions for the performance of construction works, environmental projects, etc. 419 unemployed persons were included under this measure, with a total budget of 19,920,000.00, or an average of MKD 47,542.00 per beneficiary.

Having in mind the type of works which include infrastructure, sewage cleaning, afforestation, water supply systems reconstruction, tiling, paving paths, etc., and due to lack of data, we can only conclude that the beneficiaries are mainly men. Even if our assumption were wrong, the percentage of women would be insignificant. Therefore, we point out that when creating employment policies and measures, in this case public works, gender issues should be taken into consideration and opportunities for the support of ventures that are not purely infrastructural, but also programmes where women can easily be involved (as providing care for elderly citizens) should be reviewed.

This is especially important from the aspect of introduction of similar measure in 2009 with a total budget of MKD 228,980,000.

Finally, these points are intended to open a discussion and to encourage the awareness on the funds and budgets allocation between the end users, men and women, and the need for equal distribution in the processes of policy planning and implementation.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

- ◆ Institutions are facing with great responsibility and obligation to improve the formal education system, adult education and continuous professional education. The latest reforms in the education and introduction of 'Business and Entrepreneurship' as an obligatory subject in the secondary school curricula is extremely important for the preparation of the future generations for the needs and changes in the labour market. Nevertheless, these reforms will not overcome the current situation, when larger part of the citizens are inactive, and the biggest number of those looking for a job are not qualified, or they are semi-qualified.
- ◆ State institutions, among which are the employment centres and the Centre for Adults Education, in cooperation with the local or regional training centres and/or civil associations should start a comprehensive education process through adapted and suitable programmes for women, young people, or other categories of beneficiaries for acquiring skills, knowledge and change of opinions, and those programmes will be a result of the needs, and they will meet the demands of the labour market.
- ◆ Considerations through research of the possibilities and the obstacles certain categories of groups, men, women, young boys and girls, face in the labour market, including an analysis of the demand of specific knowledge and skills, would be a valuable material that might be a base for the future state policies, and for measures to be undertaken with an essential potential for transformation of the existing situation and for faster and easier integration of young people and women in the labour market.
- ◆ It is necessary to introduce new separate programmes for training, counseling and other forms of support and motivation for women to activate themselves in the labour market.
- ◆ We point out that it is necessary all policies and strategies to contain a sound analysis of the financial allocation of means, and the gender budgeting should become an essential part of planning, implementation and monitoring of policies and strategies of the state. When distributing the budget funds, attention should be paid to the more equitable and balanced allocation of budget resources matching the needs of the various categories of beneficiaries.
- ◆ *Examples from the member countries of the European Union concerning training and education*⁶⁷

Experiences of the EU member countries show there is a serious approach to the realization of the national reform programmes founded on the European Employment Strategy, where genders are central, and education is one of the basic mechanisms for tackling the unemployment and non-inclusion of certain groups of citizens.

Hungary, within the frames of its NES, in the part of the employment and integration of women in the labour market delivers training and services/counseling to help women to return to the labour market as employed or entrepreneurs.

The Government of **Sweden** allocates funds for establishing a network of female entrepreneurship ambassadors, whose task is to encourage women through trainings, consultations and exchange of their own experiences to become involved in the market labour.

⁶⁷ National Reform Programmes 2008 and Gender Aspects in the European Employment Strategy, European Commission, Report, March 2009.

Slovenia, in its programme for self-employment and entrepreneurship promotion provides for training and motivation of the potential women-entrepreneurs among the female students.

In order to encourage the diligence among young people and to improve the investment in human capita, **Estonia** develops a seven-year Strategy for employment of young people. A so-called programme Career Counseling System is developed in each and every municipality in Estonia as a result of this strategy. The strategy includes volunteer work and participation in non-formal education, developing entrepreneurship spirit and practical work among the young people and education in the choice of their future profession.

SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Government of the Republic of Macedonia and all relevant institutions, which are included in the processes of development and implementation of active employment policies and social protection programmes, demonstrate political will, understanding and readiness to include the different groups of social categories and beneficiaries in the labour market in a way that would have impact on the reduction of poverty and unemployment and would provide for a greater social cohesion and better quality of living for all.
- MLSP – Sector for Equal Opportunities, within the context of the support to policies that promote gender equality, demonstrated its readiness to carry out a gender budget analysis of its own policies (active employment policies and social welfare) and their respective budgets, as a first step of a systemic approach to issues of equality and equal opportunities for men and women. This is another strong indicator the gender equality issues are not marginal issues and they are of essential importance in the further policy creation.
- Nevertheless, one of the basic difficulties we faced during the gender budget analysis of active employment policies and social protection is the non-existence of statistical data divided per gender. They are an extremely valuable data and source of information for the understanding of the current situation and more efficient planning of the future actions, so that the society as a whole can feel the benefits in the end.
- Therefore, the analysis indicates that the overall policy planning and implementation processes, the strategies and analyses, as well as instruments for monitoring and evaluation thereof must not be gender neutral. They should contain gender breakdown of statistical data and data cross-referenced according to various parameters, including gender analytical information that clarify the statistical differences. Divided and cross-referenced in this manner, statistical data should become a routine part of each governmental initiative.
- Gender equality is a fundamental principle of the European Employment Strategy whose basic postulate is ‘to attract as many people as possible in the labour market’ and to improve the position of groups and individuals, especially those at the margins of the labour market. These commitments are explicitly emphasized in all strategic, programme and operational documents where the measures and activities of the active employment policies are defined, as well as the categories of beneficiaries – women, young people, long-term unemployed, social welfare beneficiaries, single

mothers, children without parents, persons with special needs, elderly persons.

- Still, based on the gender budget analysis of the active employment policies, we may conclude that there is a significant discrepancy between the ambitious strategic plans and their operational application concerning gender issues; therefore we cannot validate the gender sensitivity of the measures. The gender approach is random and it is not supported by complementary instruments and measures, including those programmes which have women as a specific target group.
- In the absence of critical criteria, encouraging measures, and other instruments to support and cover a specific group of beneficiaries (adults, long-term unemployed, women, women from the ethnic communities, youth, etc.), the active employment policies shall not be able to achieve the expected results that are laid down by the strategic documents.
- The competent authorities must develop methodologies that would benefit the objectives and the target groups, and devise ways to introduce provisional measures and mechanisms to facilitate the target groups' access to the measures.
- One of the basic aspects of introduction of gender issues in the employment policies is that they should not be restrictive, but open for all citizens.
- The active employment policies include only the category of persons registered in the EARM who are looking for a job. We point to the need for opening of the active employment policies toward the no, they should not be restrictive, but open for all citizens, in particular the inactive ones, by introducing activities for their encouragement and for inclusion, in particular of women, in the labour market.
- It is of crucial importance that, in the course of the development, implementation and monitoring of the active employment policies, proper account shall be taken of the double discrimination and difficulties that women from the rural areas and women from particular ethnic groups are facing in the labour market.
- There is an evident need of further researches to monitor the sustainability of the formalized businesses, and special studies of the causes that enable, i.e., impede the sustainability of the business for a longer period of time, or for finding a lasting solution for the unemployment. The studies should incorporate assessments of the effects and impact of the policies, strategies and programmes on men and women, ethnic and social groups, the youth and other categories of beneficiaries with a breakdown by gender.
- Having regard to the fact that active employment policies should to a great extent facilitate a speedier integration into the labour market of the beneficiaries of social assistance benefits, there is a need for a greater cooperation and coordination of all competent institutions that are involved in the process, so as to provide for a balanced access to working engagements for both women and men.
- As regards the social welfare, which represents a very important aspect of the social protection system, through which the state provides its care and assistance to the most vulnerable categories of the population, the different priorities and interests of women and men, which have deep implications on the citizens' social status, have not been sufficiently taken into account. Therefore, there is a necessity of crucial integration of the gender dimension in the creation, implementation and the assessment of the effects of the social welfare policies, so that it can address different needs and interests of beneficiaries.

- The stakeholders of the development, implementation and evaluation of the effects of social welfare policies, and in particular the CSW employees, who are working directly with the potential and actual beneficiaries of permanent financial allowances, should be particularly sensitized about the gender issues within each of the six different categories of beneficiaries. That would require training for the staff on the specific gender needs, in order to provide for an equal access to services and respect of the integrity of all beneficiaries.
- Furthermore, in circumstances when the greatest potential of the Macedonian state politics is focused on the economic reforms and tackling the poverty, it is necessary to consider other alternative ways to encourage initiatives in the area of the entrepreneurship and which will encourage both men and women to become involved in the labour market more actively.
- Strategies for support and encouraging civil associations, initiatives and/or groups whose basic mission is the reduction of poverty, labour market analysis, training and informing on the area of the entrepreneurship and related topics, support groups, promotion of positive examples of businesswomen, counseling and networking, etc., can considerably contribute to the development of the society as a whole.
- Finally, gender budgeting should become an essential part of planning, implementation and monitoring of policies and strategies of the state, with a sound analysis of the financial distribution of the resources, in a way that would enable the more equitable and balanced allocation of budget resources matching the needs of the various categories of beneficiaries.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. *A learning Programme in Action: Unifem Gender Responsive Budgeting Programme Mid-term Review Summary Report*, February 2004,
2. Budlender.D., and Hewitt.G., *Engendering Budgets: A Practitioners Guide to Understanding and Implementing Gender-Responsive Budgets*, <http://www.gender-budgets.org-content-view-165-153->
3. Vehner.J., and Bianima., *Parliament, Budget and Gender, Manual for Parliamentarians*, IPU, UNDP, VBI, UNIFEM, Skopje, 2009.
4. *Gender Budgeting*, Directorate General of Human Rights, Strasbourg, 2005.
5. *Gender Mainstreaming Manual, A book of practical methods from*
6. *the Swedish Gender Mainstreaming Support Committee (JämStöd)*, Ann Boman Committee Chair, -Ulrika Eklund, Carina Löfgren <http://www.regeringen.se-content-1-c6-08-19-82-3532cd34.pdf>
7. *People-oriented Analyses, Regional Development, Local Self-government and the Quality of Life*, Report, UNDP, March 2009
8. *Women and Men in Macedonia*, State Statistics Office, Skopje, 2008
9. *Law on Social Protection*, 'Official Gazette of the RM' No.50-97
10. *Law on Social Protection*, 'Official Gazette of the RM' No.97 of 24 June 2009
11. *Law on Local Self-Government*, 'Official Gazette of the RM' No.5 of 29.01.2002
12. *Report on the Realization of the Active Policies – Employment Measures of the Operational Plan for Active Employment Policies 2007 provided for under the Operational Programme of the Government of the RM 2006-2010*
13. *Report on the work of the Sector for Inspection Monitoring of the application of the laws and other regulations governing the area of social protection in 2008*, MLSP.
14. *Report on Due Notice*, UNDP, 2007
15. *Report on the Operational Plan for Active Employment Policies 2007 and their sustainability in 2008 and past realization of the Operational Plan for Active Employment Policies 2008*
16. *Information on the implementation of the Operational Plan for Active Programmes and Employment Measures 2008 and guidelines for drafting the Operational Plan for Active Programmes and Employment Measures 2009*, January 2009, MLSP and EARM
17. *Research and analyses, documents. Volume 2* Institute for Social Activities, Skopje, 2007
18. *On the Road to EU, Contribution of the Civil Society to the Policy Creating of the Social Inclusion in the Republic of Macedonia*, MLSP, Skopje, 2008 Sarraf, *Gender Responsive Government Budgeting*, International Monetary Fund (2003)

19. *Ka rodnom budzetiranju, vodit*, priredila Tatjana Duric Kuzmanovic Zenske studije i istrazivanja, Futura publikacije, Novi Sad, 2007.
20. *National Employment Action Plan 2009-2010*, MLSP
21. *National Action Plan for Gender Equality 2007-2012*, Skopje 2007.
22. *National Employment Strategy 2010*.
23. *National Employment Action Plan 2006-2008*
24. *National Development Plan (2007-2009)*
25. *National Report on the Analysis of the Skills Demand in the Labour Market in the Republic of Macedonia*, EARM, June 2007
26. *National Report on the Analysis of the Skills Demand in the Labour Market in the Republic of Macedonia*, EARM, June 2008
27. *Operational Plan for Active Programmes and Employment Measures 2008*
28. *Operational Plan for Active Programmes and Employment Measures 2009*.
29. *Operational Programme of the Government of the RM 2006-2010*
30. Manual for the commission on equal opportunities of the local self-government units, OSCE Spillover Mission, Skopje, 2007.
31. Puljiz. V., 'Social Politics in Post-Yugoslav Countries – Heritage, Continuity and Changes (Historical Context And Social Politics)', in *Framing New Social Politics: Actors, Dimensions and Reforms*, University of Ss. Cyril and Methodius, Faculty of Philosophy, Institute of Social Work and Social Policy, Friedrich Ebert Foundation, Office, Skopje, 2007.

Sharp.R., and Vas Dev.S., *Bridging the Gap between Gender Analysis and Gender-Responsive Budgets: Key Lessons from a Pilot Project in the Republic of the Marshall Islands*, Hawke Research Institute, University of South Australia, Magill, South Australia, 2004.
32. *Social Protection and Social Inclusion in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, European Commission, Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities Unit E2 Manuscript completed in October 2007.
33. *Statistical Overview: Population and Social Statistics, Social Protection of Children, Youths and Adults in the Republic of Macedonia 2007-2008*, State Statistical Office, Skopje, October 2008.
34. *Strategic plan of the MLSP*
35. Amsterdam Treaty, 1997, available at: www.europa.eu.int/eur-lex.

Translation
Ad Verbum

Proofreading
Ad Verbum

Design and Print Preparation
Van Gog – Graphic Studio

Printed by
Van Gog

CIP - Каталогизација во публикација
Национална и универзитетска библиотека "Св. Климент Охридски", Скопје

342.722.073.52(497.7)

Gender – budget analysis of active employment policies and social protection in Republic of Macedonia, -
Skopje: Ministry of labour and social policy, 2010. - 80 стр. : табели 21 см

Фусноти кон текстот – Библиографија: стр. 79 - 80

ISBN 978-608-4595-06-9

а) Родова Еднаквост – Финансиски аспекти - Македонија
COBISS.MK – ID 81372170
